



## **LAX/COMMUNITY NOISE ROUNDTABLE**

### Recap of the Regular Meeting of January 11, 2017

#### **Roundtable Members Present**

Denny Schneider, Westchester Neighbors Association  
Carl Jacobson, City of El Segundo  
Blake LaMar, City of Palos Verdes Estates  
Robert Nemeth, City of Rancho Palos Verdes  
Margaret Peters, City of Los Angeles – Council District 8  
Omar Pulido, City of Los Angeles – Council District 11  
Danna Cope, LAX Area Advisory Committee  
Stephen Murray, City of Culver City  
Teresa Real Sebastian, City of Monterey Park  
Jim Withrow, City of Inglewood  
Polly Low, City of Rosemead  
Laurie Smith, Bluff Park Neighborhood Association  
Terry Boyle, Federal Aviation Administration (FAA)  
Kathryn Pantoja, Los Angeles World Airports (LAWA)

#### **LAWA and Consultant Staff**

David Chan, LAWA  
Bob Gilbert, LAWA  
Steve Alverson, ESA  
Karen Calderon, ESA

A quorum of the members was present.

#### **1. Welcome/Review of the Meeting Format**

Roundtable Facilitator Steve Alverson welcomed everyone to the meeting and reviewed the meeting format. Mr. Alverson indicated that the Roundtable meetings are facilitated in order to stay on topic and on schedule. He noted that there is a period for public comment on the agenda and that the Roundtable Chair may permit additional comments on other agenda items as time permits.

## **2. Call to order, Pledge of Allegiance, and Identification of Those Present**

Roundtable Chairman Denny Schneider called the meeting to order at 7:02 p.m. PST in the Samuel Greenberg Boardroom at LAX. Member Withrow led the Roundtable members and audience in the pledge of allegiance. Roundtable members and members of the audience introduced themselves and stated their affiliations.

## **3. Comments from the Public**

Chairman Denny Schneider opened the public comment period and asked that speakers keep their remarks to three minutes.

A resident of Santa Monica who lives near the Santa Monica VOR indicated he was attending the meeting to gather information that he can share with other residents in his community who are concerned about increased aircraft noise. The resident believes that there has been a lowering in the altitude and concentration of flights over his home recently and requested any available information regarding aircraft noise levels in his community. Chairman Schneider and LAWA staff member Kathryn Pantoja agreed to provide the resident with the existing studies and resources that are available. He asked how he could bring items to the Roundtable to consider. He was told that he could speak to Martin Ruben who was unable to attend tonight's meeting.

A resident of Santa Monica Canyon also spoke to the Roundtable about aircraft noise issues indicating that aircraft recently flew over her home at 2:15 am to 2:30 am. She stated that the nighttime runway use period was not being adhered to. LAWA staff member David Chan noted that the FAA may deviate from Over-Ocean Operations at LAX due to weather and other factors.

LAWA's Chief Development Officer, Bob Gilbert, told the Roundtable that LAWA is going to intensify its efforts to be more responsive and ensure better communication and cooperation with the Roundtable.

## **4. Appointment/Confirmation of At-Large Members for a Two-Year Term – January 2017 to December 2018**

LAWA staff member David Chan noted that the Roundtable Bylaws require at-large members to submit a letter of interest to renew their membership every two years. He acknowledged the receipt of letters from Westchester Neighbors Association and North Westdale Neighborhood Association. Mr. Chan noted that no letters have been received from United Homeowner Association (UHA) and Ladera Heights Civic Association (LHCA). He explained that UHA representative JoAnn Williams intends to remain on the Roundtable but was unable to submit the letter in time. He added that LHCA representative Yvonne Bedford had indicated she no longer wanted to participate in the Roundtable. Chairman Schneider's recommendation to appoint and confirm the membership of Westchester Neighbors Association and North Westdale Neighborhood Association as at-large members for another two-year term was approved without objection. Chairman Schneider also suggested that the Roundtable consider renewing UHA's membership after receiving its letter.

## **5. Consideration of Confirming the Membership/Participation Status of Non-Active Members Representing a Jurisdiction**

LAWA staff member Kathryn Pantoja recommended that LAWA undertake a process to confirm the membership status of non-active Roundtable members that represent a jurisdiction. She noted that there is no expiration date once these members are appointed and that the roster of members is becoming long as several new members have recently been added. She noted that a long membership roster with a number of inactive members can affect the ability to have a quorum. She added that the Roundtable Bylaws require that at least 25 percent of Roundtable members from at least four separate jurisdictions to be present for a binding vote. Since there are currently 28 voting members, at least seven members need to be present to have a quorum. Ms. Pantoja noted that several long-standing members have not participated in Roundtable meetings for a number of years. Ms. Pantoja suggested sending out a letter to non-active members requesting jurisdictions who would like to continue to be members of the Roundtable appoint a representative and an alternate to attend Roundtable meetings. She added that LAWA would then perform a periodic cleanup of the membership roster every one to two years.

Member Real Sebastian recommended approving members for a two-year term and confirming their reappointment, which would take the burden off LAWA staff. The Roundtable Facilitator stated that Member Real Sebastian's suggestion would require a change to the Roundtable Bylaws. Member Cope suggested making an appointment for members and alternates because some groups do not have alternates.

Member Real Sebastian made a motion to approve LAWA's recommendation to send a letter to current non-active members to confirm their membership status and to perform this process periodically. The motion was seconded by Member Cope and unanimously passed by the Roundtable.

Chairman Schneider invited Laurie Smith, a representative from the Bluff Park Neighborhood Association, to describe her organization's interest in becoming a Roundtable member. Ms. Smith indicated that she is a long-term resident of Long Beach. She noted that in October 2016, she spoke to LAWA about nighttime departures from LAX that turn southeast around the Palos Verdes Peninsula and overfly Long Beach. Ms. Smith noted that there has been a noticeable increase in aircraft overflights over Long Beach for the past several years and particularly in 2016. She added that she is attending this Roundtable meeting to try to obtain an explanation regarding this increase and also to explain why she would like to be a member of the Roundtable. Member Real Sebastian's motion to approve the membership of the Bluff Park Neighborhood Association with Ms. Laurie Smith as its representative was seconded by Member Cope and approved unanimously by the Roundtable.

## **6. Review/Approve Roundtable Work Program**

LAWA staff member David Chan described the changes, edits, and additions, made to the Roundtable Work Program reflecting work that was accomplished last year as well as other required updates. Mr. Chan described the edits to Sections A1, A3, A7, A10, A12, A13, C3, and C5. Mr. Chan also noted that LAWA is recommending that Work Program Items A13 and C5 be closed.

Member Real Sebastian's motion to approve the Roundtable Work Program with a revision to the language in Work Program Item A7 as follows: replace "City of Monterey Park Planning Commissioner" with "a resident, who is also a Planning Commissioner, from the City of Monterey Park" was seconded by Member Low and unanimously approved by the Roundtable.

The approved version of the January 2017 Roundtable Work Program can be found at <http://www.lawa.org/LAXNoiseRoundTable.aspx>.

## **7. Discussion on Improving Roundtable Meeting Format**

The Roundtable facilitator recommended ways of improving the Roundtable meeting format to conduct meetings more effectively and efficiently for the Roundtable's consideration: (1) Distribute the Statistical Reports for Roundtable members to review before the meeting and ask questions during the Roundtable Member Discussion Agenda Item; (2) Prepare a written summary of current Aviation Noise News topics and distribute to the Roundtable members; and (3) Implement a meeting note taker to allow the meeting Facilitator to focus more on keeping the agenda items within their allotted time frames. The Roundtable facilitator also suggested if these initial measures did not solve the problem, the Roundtable members may wish to consider increasing meeting duration, and/or increasing meeting frequency.

Member Jacobson noted that many Roundtable members do not have time to read all of the materials before the meeting and asked if there would still be a summary presented at the Roundtable meetings that covered the most important points as that is helpful for discussion. The Roundtable facilitator responded that the recommendation is to cover the item only if asked by a Roundtable member. Member Cope added that the Roundtable Facilitator's review of the Aviation Noise News was a vital part of the discussion since he always added something interesting to the conversation. Member Real Sebastian suggested that if needed, adding time to each of the meetings instead of adding more meetings, since it takes an effort for all members to get the meeting location.

Ms. Jacqueline Hamilton, a representative from Karen Bass' office, asked the Roundtable members if they have considered having the meeting in another venue since some people find that the current location is difficult to find and parking is not easily accessible. Member Pulido suggested moving the Roundtable meetings to Council District 11's meeting room on Manchester and Lincoln. He added that this location is not too far away from the current location but would be outside of LAX and has ample parking space. Ms. Pantoja asked Mr. Pulido about the venue's availability, AV equipment, microphones/sound system, and other logistics. Mr. Pulido noted that the room does not have a sound system and agreed to do further research on the meeting room and report back at the next meeting. Members also discussed how moving the Roundtable meetings away from the airport may affect getting airline representative attendance.

The Roundtable facilitator reminded the Roundtable members that the current topic was about revising the Roundtable meeting's format and not about changing the meeting venue, although that topic could be discussed at a future Roundtable meeting if the members wished to do so.

Member Real Sebastian motion to put the Statistical Reports and Aviation Noise News on the agenda as a consent-like item and requested the meeting materials be sent to members at least 48 hours in advance was seconded by Member LaMar and was unanimously approved by the Roundtable. LAWA representative Pantoja indicated that LAWA is committed to getting the meeting materials to the members on a more timely basis. Member Cope requested printed copies of the materials be provided at the Roundtable meetings as well.

## **8. Roundtable Member Discussion**

Chairman Schneider noted that in the Statistical Update on LAX Aircraft Operations included 34 non-conforming east departures for the month of November 2016, which is a large increase from previous months. The FAA's LAX Air Traffic Control Tower representative Terry Boyle noted that the runway (25R) has been shortened and that may have been a contributing factor to this increase. LAWA representative Pantoja also noted that this was a worst-case scenario given the shortened runway and rainy/windy weather during that timeframe, which forced aircraft to takeoff to the east. Ms. Pantoja also noted that many airlines are already reducing their payloads in order to safely to depart to the west with the shortened runway so when the easterly winds increase, they have little choice but to depart east.

Member Smith noted that most of the non-conforming flights were international airlines and wanted to know what could be done to make international airlines more conforming. Chairman Schneider noted that a number of countries do not let planes land during the nighttime, which may mean that they must depart the U.S. at night to arrive at their destination in the daytime. A member noted that the FAA has already told LAWA that they cannot control the time flights depart. Member Smith suggested the Roundtable members talk to their respective representatives in Congress about these issues. Mr. Alverson noted that in 1990 Congress passed the Aircraft Noise and Capacity Act (ANCA), which phased out the noisiest aircraft. He added that in exchange for phasing out these aircraft, Congress severely limited an airport proprietor's ability to restrict aircraft operations. He noted that LAWA attempted to place restrictions on east departures at night through a 14 CFR Part 161 Study, but the request was denied by the FAA.

Member Smith noted that ANCA is outdated and it needs to be changed. She suggested that with the implementation of the SoCal Metroplex, the airlines are going to save a lot of money and that can be used as leverage to get them to comply with more stringent noise standards. Member Pulido noted that if airlines are going to use more fuel they wouldn't necessarily save money.

Ms. Hamilton noted that she believes talking to Congressional representatives is very important. She suggested that the Roundtable write Congresswoman Bass a very specific letter that states the exact legislation the Roundtable is seeking (e.g., give LAWA more authority in limiting nighttime flights). The Roundtable facilitator told Roundtable members that since this issue is of general interest to the Roundtable, they could decide to put it on the agenda to discuss at a future meeting.

Ms. Kathryn Pantoja noted that foreign carriers were departing east more often than domestic carriers because they fly more transpacific routes, which means they have to carry the most fuel, and heavier aircraft are most affected by a tailwind. In addition, Ms. Pantoja noted that airlines do not want to depart to the east because it is more costly; departing to the east with mild easterly wind conditions is something that the airlines have to do in order to operate safely. She noted that LAWA request airlines to fill out a form when they depart east to provide detailed information about each flight and an explanation of why it occurred.

Member Pulido suggested that the Roundtable needs to be strategic in the way it uses its capital with Congress and was unsure about expending all of it on this infrequently occurring issue when there are other issues such as SoCal Metroplex.

Ms. Hamilton noted that the FAA was adhering to the federal law. She added that the problem is that the current law does not reflect the issues that the Roundtable wants to address.

Member Real Sebastian then made a request to, at the earliest time possible, add an agenda item to discuss a procedure that would bring aircraft noise issues to higher elected officials when needed.

## **9. Formal Action Items and Other Requests**

### **Formal Actions Taken**

Chairman Denny Schneider's recommendation to appoint and confirm the membership of Westchester Neighbors Association and North Westdale Neighborhood Association as at-large members for a two-year term was approved without objection.

Member Real Sebastian's motion to accept LAWA's recommendation to send a letter to current non-active members to confirm their membership status and to perform this process periodically was seconded by Member Cope and unanimously passed by the Roundtable.

Member Real Sebastian's motion to approve the membership of Bluff Park Neighborhood Association with Laurie Smith as its representative was seconded by Member Cope and approved unanimously by the Roundtable.

Member Real Sebastian's motion to approve the Roundtable Work Program with a revision to the language in Work Program Item A7 as follows: replace "City of Monterey Park Planning Commissioner" with "a resident, who is also a Planning Commissioner, from the City of Monterey Park" was seconded by Member Low and unanimously approved by the Roundtable.

Member Real Sebastian's motion to improve the Roundtable's meeting format by adopting the Roundtable Facilitator's recommendations to put the Statistical Update on Aircraft Operations and Aviation Noise News items in a consent-like item was seconded by member LaMar and unanimously approved by the Roundtable.

### **Other Items**

Member Real Sebastian suggested that the Roundtable review and revise the Roundtable Bylaws to establish a length of time for the membership term that would require all members to reaffirm their continued participation for another term.

Members of the Roundtable discussed exploring options for other meeting venues with easier public access and larger room capacity for the Roundtable's bimonthly meetings. Member Pulido offered to investigate using Council District 11's meeting room as a potential alternative venue.

Member LaMar requested that LAWA provide a large countdown clock or timer that is visible to speakers at the podium so that they can see when their allotted time is running out.

Members requested that, at the earliest time possible, an item be placed on the Roundtable agenda to discuss a procedure for the Roundtable to bring noise issues to higher elected officials when needed.

**10. Adjournment**

Mr. Chan noted that the next regular Roundtable meeting will be held in the Samuel Greenberg Boardroom at LAX on Wednesday, March 8, 2017 at 7 pm PST. Chairman Schneider adjourned the meeting at 9:00 pm PST.