



## **LAX/COMMUNITY NOISE ROUNDTABLE**

### Recap of the Regular Meeting of March 13, 2013

#### **Roundtable Members Present**

Denny Schneider, Chairman, Westchester Neighbors Association  
Carl Jacobson, Vice Chairman, City of El Segundo  
Beverly Ackerson, PANIC  
Danna Cope, LAX Area Advisory Committee  
Blake LaMar, City of Palos Verdes Estates  
Yvonne Bedford, Ladera Heights Civic Association  
JoAnn Williams, United Homeowners Association  
John Bailey, Southeast Torrance Homeowners' Association  
Martin Rubin, North Westdale Neighborhood Association  
Chad Molnar, City of Los Angeles – CD11  
Rolan Morel, Federal Aviation Administration  
Michael Feldman, LAWA

#### **LAWA, Airline, and Consultant Staff**

Scott Tatro, LAWA  
Kathryn Pantoja, LAWA  
David Chan, LAWA  
Dan Delane, FedEx  
Steve Alverson, Roundtable Facilitator

#### **Guest Speaker**

Cliff Moser, LAX Area Advisory Committee

A quorum of the members was present.

#### **1. Welcome/Review of the Meeting Format**

Roundtable Facilitator Steve Alverson welcomed everyone to the meeting and reviewed the meeting format. Mr. Alverson indicated that the Roundtable meetings are facilitated in order to stay on topic and on schedule. He added that there would be a period for public comments and the Chair may entertain questions from the audience as time permits.

## **2. Call to order**

Roundtable Chairman Denny Schneider called the meeting to order at 7:00 pm PDT in the Samuel Greenberg Boardroom at LAX.

## **3. Comments from the Public**

Chairman Schneider opened the public comment period. A 25-year resident of Marina Del Rey, Lynne Shapiro, expressed concern about an increase in the number of large air carrier jet departures from LAX flying over Marina Del Rey. She said she had filed complaints with LAWA and had received responses indicating that aircraft flying over the Marina during the reported time period are not associated with LAX; they are associated with other airports. She indicated that she disagrees with LAWA findings and believes that aircraft flying over the Marina are originating from LAX. As there were no further comments, Chairman Schneider closed the public comment period.

Note: During a later discussion, FAA representative Rolan Morel indicated that missed approaches and/or go arounds may explain the air carrier jet aircraft the resident has seen from time to time over Marina Del Rey. He added that while significantly less frequent than departures, missed approaches and go arounds associated with LAX's north runway complex occur frequently enough to be noticeable in Marina Del Rey. He stated the missed approaches and go arounds are critical for maintaining safety separations and will be used whenever needed.

## **4. Consideration of United Homeowners Associations' request for re-appointment to the Roundtable membership**

LAWA staff member David Chan stated that the Roundtable had received a membership request letter from the United Homeowners Association (UHA) expressing interest in resuming its membership in the Roundtable. Mr. Chan explained that the Roundtable had suspended UHA's membership in January pending receipt of the membership request letter. He asked the members to vote as to approve or disapprove the membership request.

Member Danna Cope's motion to accept the re-appointment of UHA's membership was seconded by member John Bailey and approved unanimously by the Roundtable.

## **5. Briefing on UC Davis Noise Symposium**

Cliff Moser, member of the LAX Area Advisory Committee, attended the UC Davis Aviation Noise Symposium that was held in Costa Mesa on March 3-6, 2013. He briefed the Roundtable members on the highlights of the topics covered at the Symposium and shared his prospective and experience. He said the Symposium included a workshop on Sunday, main sessions on Monday and Tuesday, and a technical session on the Airport Environmental Design Tool (AEDT) on Wednesday. He estimated about 300 people across the United States, Europe, and South America attended the Symposium.

Mr. Moser said the workshop on Sunday was focused on getting the newcomers up to speed. Of the main sessions on Monday and Tuesday, he talked about the keynote speech from Steve Fulton of Naverus, which was focused on the noise and air emissions benefits of NextGen. Mr. Moser observed that he felt there was a good balancing on the implementation of NextGen in term of the effects/benefits to the community. He thought the

panel discussion on the effects of the Optimized Profile Descent (OPD) on aircraft altitudes near La Habra Heights was interesting. He also described a presentation by the Santa Monica Airport (SMO) Director on leaded aviation fuel. He indicated that only small amounts of leaded aviation fuel are produced, which is equivalent to about 25 percent of all of the fuel that is emitted through evaporation. He found the panel that discussed the new FAA policies on Sound Insulation that requires homes to be within the 65 CNEL contour and have an interior noise level greater than 45 CNEL to be interesting.

Steve Alverson added that Scott Tatro, Steve May, and Brian Bergman participated on the OPD panel discussion moderated by him, which was well received by the attendees.

Member Martin Rubin asked if there were any community members at the Symposium. Mr. Moser said that there were a number of community members at the Symposium.

## **6. Discussion on Departure Delay Issue between SMO and LAX**

FAA representative Rolan Morel from the LAX Air Traffic Control Tower gave a presentation on the dependencies of westbound aircraft departures off of LAX and SMO and the resulting departure delays. After reviewing some air traffic control fundamentals, he explained that each air traffic controller is responsible for a sector of airspace and no aircraft can enter or leave the airspace without coordinating with the neighboring air traffic controller, who in some cases may work in a different facility such as the Southern California TRACON (SCT). Each controller is also responsible for maintaining horizontal (3 nautical miles) and vertical (1,000 feet) separation between aircraft.

Mr. Morel explained that aircraft departing from SMO and LAX are on conflicting courses. FAA controllers must coordinate and sequence the departures to ensure that they meet required separation standards. In addition, nearby terrain and the surrounding airspace configurations limit options available to controllers. Mr. Morel stated SMO departure aircraft are sequenced into the LAX departure flow. Mr. Morel explained that the FAA has been looking for ways to reduce departure delays at both airports. Coordination procedures between three facilities, LAX, SMO, and SCT, are being developed regarding confirmation of an aircraft flying a 265 heading west of the shoreline. This confirmation would allow LAX departures holding for the SMO departure to depart sooner. When established on a 265 west of the shoreline, the SMO aircraft would no longer conflict with the LAX departure corridor.

Member Martin Rubin recalled a time in the 1990s when SMO aircraft turned to a 250 degree heading shortly after takeoff, which eliminated the conflicts between LAX and SMO departures. He added that at some point the SMO departure heading was changed to 210 degrees creating the conflict with LAX departures. Mr. Morel said he did not recall a time when the SMO departures were on a 250 degree heading.

Member Chad Molnar asked if the separation would be required even if there were no SMO departures. Mr. Morel responded yes.

Mr. Chan asked if the departure delay issue could cause a runway imbalance at LAX. Mr. Morel said that it could however LAX ATCT balances the different complex departure load by taxiing aircraft to the south complex when necessary.

Member Danna Cope asked if moving Runway 24R 260 feet to the north would create further delays with the understanding that 24R is reserved for arrivals. Mr. Morel said the runway shift would not make a difference as it is a relatively small distance compared to the required 3-mile separation requirement.

Chairman Schneider asked if traffic at LAX increases and there are fewer and fewer holes to fit SMO departures in, will the departure delays become worse in the future? Mr. Morel said that most likely the departure delays could get worse.

Scott Tatro said that the Metroplex process is supposed to analyze and deal with this problem.

Member Chad Molnar asked if SMO aircraft will be held longer in the future as LAX departures increase. Mr. Morel said yes, the SMO departure aircraft would be sequenced in the LAX departure flow. Each scenario is dependent on traffic including arrival and departure demand to SMO and both complexes at LAX. LAX ATC takes all factors into consideration to provide the most efficient and safe movement of air traffic.

Member Rubin commented that the problem has its roots in noise abatement at SMO and the departure track at SMO should be put back to where it was in the 1990s.

Chairman Schneider asked how many SMO departures FAA can handle. Mr. Morel responded that 8 to 9 SMO departures in an hour could cause a delay at LAX. Mr. Morel stated Collaborative Work Groups are in the process of recommending procedures such as the confirmation of a 265 degree heading after the shoreline to reduce LAX and SMO departure delays.

Member Ackerson asked if the FAA had studied the dBs regarding this departure delay issue at the two airports. Mr. Morel said LAX ATC had not studied the noise and added that LAX ATC is aware and sensitive to noise issues at the airport and surrounding communities. LAX ATC's primary function is to provide a safe and efficient air traffic system in compliance with restrictions developed by noise and environment groups such as this.

On a separate note, Mr. Morel mentioned that the FAA Tower is looking at ways of not referencing the LAX VOR when issuing turning instructions to aircraft departing at LAX as this practice would most likely result in aircraft turning early. He said the FAA will look at referencing the shoreline as a way to help reduce early turns at LAX.

Mr. Morel's presentation on departure delays between SMO and LAX can be found on the Roundtable webpage at <http://www.lawa.org/LAXNoiseRoundTable.aspx>.

## **7. Work Program A5: Discussion of Easterly Departures from Northern Runways Turning North and Prior Recommendations to FAA OAPM**

Mr. David Chan said he wanted to address the request that the Roundtable had previously made which was to re-examine why Work Program A5 was not included in the letter to FAA for consideration in the Optimization of Airspace and Procedures in the Metroplex (OAPM) process. He explained that that work program A5 involves turboprop aircraft departing eastbound during east flow. The issue is that these aircraft turn to the north upon departures causing noise disturbance to the neighborhoods northwest of the airport. He said that back in 2004 the Roundtable had asked the FAA to consider developing an RNAV procedure to

re-route these turboprops further south. Because of the potential of shifting noise from one area to another, the FAA indicated that it needed a consensus among the affected communities and stakeholders prior to developing such a procedure. In 2005, the Roundtable invited the affected communities to discuss the issue and to try to reach a consensus. However an agreement was not reached. Mr. Chan said that he did not provide a recommendation on this item because of the issue with shifting noise and that no agreement was reached among the affected communities.

Mr. Chan also talked about the suggestion that Member Danna Cope made at the previous meeting which was to raise the altitudes on arrivals to allow departing turboprops to fly as high as possible as a way to reduce noise. Mr. Chan explained that aircraft on the arrival route is at 7,000 feet with turboprops crossing under them at 4,000 feet. He added that he listened to ATC communication to determine if there is a climb restriction for the turboprops and found that the restriction is for these aircraft to climb to an altitude of 5,000 feet. Mr. Chan then showed a map to illustrate that turboprops take a while to reach the 5,000 feet level. He said that turboprops tend to be slow climbers and doubted the possibility of these aircraft of performing a steep climb in order for them fly as high as possible. He said he also reviewed the east departure procedures at LAX and found that the turboprops climb at a slower rate than the jets.

He also described the noise abatement procedure at John Wayne Airport (JWA), which uses a steep climb rate. The JWA noise abatement procedure reduces noise for residents living further away from the airport, but increases noise for the residents living close-in to the airport. Therefore, having the turboprops climb faster may not necessarily improve the noise exposure in the neighborhoods northwest of LAX.

Member Danna Cope pointed out the spread of tracks that the turboprops create when they turn north after departure and suggested the Roundtable to work toward a solution. Mr. Chan indicated that the turboprops are following a published procedure that directs them to fly a heading of 040 while the jets are following a heading of 055. There is a 15-degree separation between the two aircraft types with the intention of separating the slower moving turboprops from the faster moving jets. Member Blake LaMar added that if the turboprops were to move further south, it would create a difficulty for FAA to maintain that 15-degree separation. Member Chad Molnar said that a consensus among the affected communities would still need to be established.

Mr. Chan provided a prospective of how often these eastbound turboprop departures occur from the north complex. He indicated that these departures only occur during east operations and east operations only happen a small percentage of the time; about 5% in a given year. Five percent represents about 20 days in a year with majority of those days being partial days; meaning that in most cases east operations only last about 4 to 6 hours on a given day. He said occasionally when LAX is in east flow for a full 24-hour day, he identified about 30 turboprop eastbound north runway departures per day. Member Yvonne Bedford commented that air traffic has increased over Ladera Heights in the past year.

The Roundtable did not reach a consensus on this issue.

## **8. Statistical Update on Aircraft Operations**

LAWA staff member David Chan presented updated statistics for Roundtable Work Items A6, A7, and A8. Mr. Chan's presentation is summarized below.

Mr. Chan reviewed the recent trends in annual aircraft operations indicating that 2009 had the lowest level with an increasing trend since that time. He pointed out that operations for 2011 and 2012 were at about the same level. He reminded the Roundtable that trends in the overall operations tend to influence the trends of the specific operations.

#### **Work Program Item A6: Improperly Flown LOOP Departures**

**Description:** The LOOP departure procedure directs aircraft on westerly departures to turn back and re-cross the shoreline at the LAX VOR at or above 10,000 ft. to head to eastern destinations.

Mr. Chan said that aircraft crossing the shoreline below 10,000 feet has shown a decreasing trend dropping from 4 percent to 2 percent of the total loop departures from 2000 through 2012. He noted that the summer months tend to show higher levels of aircraft below 10,000 ft at the shoreline because warmer temperatures impact aircraft climb performance. He presented a graph depicting the position of aircraft relative to the LAX VOR, which shows the majority of aircraft are between 10,000 to 15,000 feet and concentrated over or near the VOR. He added airlines that had the most loop departures tend to have more loop operations under 10,000 feet.

#### **Work Program Item A7: Extended Downwind Approach**

**Description:** Aircraft arriving to LAX from the west and the north utilize an extended downwind approach at times causing aircraft to overfly Monterey Park and neighboring communities at low altitudes. Usually, the greater the number of north arrivals, the greater the need for aircraft to travel further east on the downwind leg. Weather conditions that produce low visibility can also cause this operation to increase as the FAA would need to increase the separation distance between aircraft for safety.

Mr. Chan pointed out that the number of extended downwind approaches remained at a steady level from 2010 to 2012 representing about 18% to 20% of the total north arrival traffic. Monthly figures usually reflect an increase in the summer months due to the “June Gloom” condition, which decreases visibility requiring pilots to fly further to the east to increase the aircraft separation distance to enhance safety. He indicated extended downwind approaches are usually at a low level for the month of January for the last couple of years because of good visibility conditions that usually exist during that month.

Mr. Chan noted that from midnight to 5 am, there were no flights over Monterey Park due to LAX’s Over-Ocean Operations configuration. He explained airlines that have the most extended downwind operations tend to have the most arrivals from the north.

#### **Work Program Item A8: Aircraft Arrivals Outside Regular Approach Paths**

**Description:** The short turn procedure relates to jet arrivals on the north downwind leg that turn to base leg and final prior to reaching the Harbor Freeway. This operation usually increases when a high-visibility condition exists and/or when the north arrival traffic is light. Conversely, short turn operations decrease when there is an increase in traffic and/or when there is a low-visibility condition. Short turn is also inversely related to the Extended Downwind Approach.

Mr. Chan explained that short turns have been declining since 2009 and reached their lowest level in 2012. He added that monthly figures showed short turns were at a stable level for the past several months prior to January 2013. There was an increase in short turns for January due to good visibility conditions that allowed more visual approaches. He showed the short turn flight tracks on a map along with the elevations of the hillside communities to provide an idea of which communities are affected by this operation.

Member Chad Molnar asked the Roundtable to spend a moment addressing Ms. Shapiro's earlier comment about departures over Marina Del Rey. Mr. Morel responded that it is very doubtful that LAX departures would be over Marina Del Rey. Member Michael Feldman asked if the aircraft over Marina Del Rey could be missed approaches off of the north runways. Mr. Morel said that it could be missed approaches.

The complete presentation on the statistical update on aircraft operations can be found on the Roundtable webpage at <http://www.lawa.org/LAXNoiseRoundTable.aspx>.

## **9. Work Program C4 – Update on ICAO/CAEP Aircraft Noise Stringency Standards**

Mr. Alverson provided the Roundtable with an update on the International Civil Aviation Organization's (ICAO) Committee on Aviation Environmental Protection (CAEP) recent recommendation for a new, more stringent aircraft noise standard. CAEP has recommended to ICAO a new noise standard that would reflect Stage4/Chapter 4 standards minus 7 decibels. Mr. Alverson explained that going into the CAEP's ninth meeting in Montreal in February, the airlines and aircraft manufacturers were advocating for a new standard of Stage 4/Chapter 4 minus 5 dB, while airports were advocating for Stage 4/Chapter 4 minus 9 dB. He explained that although the recommended standard was greater than what the airlines/aircraft manufacturers wanted and less than what airports had wanted, both sides were pleased with the outcome. In particular, airports were pleased with the fact that the new noise standards will go into effect in 2017 for newly manufactured large aircraft and in 2020 for newly manufactured small aircraft. Mr. Alverson said ICAO will consider the recommended noise standard at its spring meeting.

The presentation on the recommended CAEP aircraft noise stringency standards can be found on the Roundtable webpage at <http://www.lawa.org/LAXNoiseRoundTable.aspx>.

## **10. Aviation Noise News Update**

Mr. Alverson reviewed several recent aviation noise news items for the Roundtable including:

- A news report about American Airlines new livery and recent merger with US Airway leaving only three legacy airlines, which is down from six five years ago.
- An article about senate and house representatives reintroducing a bill to resurrect the L.A. Residential Helicopter Noise Relief Act that died last year. The bill was endorsed by the City of Lomita.
- An article regarding the effects on airport operations of federal sequestration cuts of \$600 million including the furlough of FAA air traffic controllers and TSA staff, which could result in delays, long security lines, and closed air traffic control towers including the tower at Santa Monica Airport.

- An article on FAA's Program Guidance Letter (PGL) 13-04 regarding a pilot program to fund the redevelopment of land acquired for noise mitigation purposes.
- An article regarding the concepts developed by a Task Group of the NextGen Advisory Committee for potential ways to comply with the Categorical Exclusion (CatEx) 2 provision in the 2012 FAA reauthorization bill.
- An article regarding the Department of Transportation's letter to the General Accounting Office emphasizing the importance of the Airport Improvement Program noise-set aside in addressing aircraft noise impacts over the next 20 years.
- An article on the authorization of the Los Angeles Board of Airport Commissioners authorization for staff to enter into a letter of agreement with the City of El Segundo for its sound insulation program to release \$9.2 million for eligible sound insulation projects.

The complete aviation noise news update can be found on the Roundtable webpage at <http://www.lawa.org/LAXNoiseRoundTable.aspx>.

## **11. Roundtable Member Discussion**

Member Carl Jacobson said that Star Helicopters out of Hawthorne Airport is hovering a helicopter at 300 to 500 feet over El Segundo. He asked if there is anything FAA can do to prevent it. Mr. Morel replied that if an operator requests permission to operate, FAA will grant it. John Bailey said he would call Commander Chuck Street at the Los Angeles Area Helicopter Operators Association and ask him to look into it.

Member Bailey moved and Member Jacobson seconded a motion to place a resolution on the May 8<sup>th</sup> meeting agenda supporting the LA Helicopter Noise Relief Act. The motion was approved unanimously.

Scott Tatro stated that the Part 161 application was submitted to the FAA in January 2013. LAWA received a letter from FAA on March 1<sup>st</sup> stating that the application was incomplete in several areas and that a letter identifying the details of the shortcomings would be provided to LAWA within ten days. Member Feldman said the Roundtable will receive an update on status of the Part 161 application at the May 8<sup>th</sup> meeting.

Chairman Schneider requested an update on the FAA's Optimization of Airspace and Procedures in the Metroplex (OAPM) process.



## **12. Review of Roundtable Actions and Requests from Members**

Mr. Alverson reviewed the Roundtable's action and request items during the meeting, which included:

### **Formal Action Items**

The Roundtable approved the request from United Homeowners Association to continue its membership as an At-Large member for a two-year term.

### **Requests from Members**

Chairman Denny Schneider requested that LAWA distribute to the Roundtable members the web link that contains presentations from the recent UC Davis Aviation Noise Symposium.

Member Mike Feldman said that LAWA will provide an update on the LAX Part 161 process to the Roundtable at the next meeting.

Chairman Denny Schneider requested that an update on the FAA's OAPM process be provided to the Roundtable.

Member John Bailey requested that the Roundtable include a resolution to support the Los Angeles Residential Helicopter Noise Relief Act for consideration at the next meeting.

## **13. Adjournment**

David Chan noted that the next LAX Roundtable meeting is scheduled for 7:00 PM on Wednesday, May 8, 2013. Chairman Schneider adjourned the meeting at 9:07 pm.