



LAX/COMMUNITY NOISE ROUNDTABLE

Recap of the Regular Meeting of March 9, 2016

Roundtable Members Present

Denny Schneider, Chairman, Westchester Neighbors Association
Carl Jacobson, Vice Chairman, City of El Segundo
Blake LaMar, City of Palos Verdes Estates
Mayor Brian Bergman, City of La Habra Heights
Omar Pulido, City of Los Angeles – Council District 11
Danna Cope, LAX Area Advisory Committee
Martin Rubin, North Westdale Neighborhood Association
June Lehrman, City of Culver City
Cesar Vega, City of Monterey Park
Jim Withrow, City of Inglewood
Terry Boyle, Federal Aviation Administration
Scott Tatro, LAWA

LAWA and Consultant Staff

René Spencer, LAWA
David Chan, LAWA
Kathryn Pantoja, LAWA
Adrian Jones, Roundtable Back-up Facilitator

A quorum of the members was present.

1. Welcome/Review of the Meeting Format

Roundtable Back-up Facilitator Adrian Jones welcomed everyone to the meeting and reviewed the meeting format. Mr. Jones indicated that the Roundtable meetings are facilitated in order to stay on topic and on schedule. He added that there would be a period for public comments and the Chairman may entertain questions from the audience as time permits.

2. Call to order

Roundtable Chairman Denny Schneider called the meeting to order at 7:03 pm PST in the Samuel Greenberg Boardroom at LAX.

3. Comments from the Public

Chairman Schneider opened the public comment period.

A resident of Santa Monica Canyon told the Roundtable that he was concerned about the perceived increase in noise generated by aircraft on approach to LAX from the north along the coastline. He hadn't noticed aircraft noise until recently although aircraft have flown by that area for years. He asked if something had changed in the approach procedures as he noticed a change in noise levels beginning last fall. He was aware of LAWA's plans to study north downwind arrival noise, but noted annual-average levels is not the correct way to analyze the noise from single-event noise "outliers". He explained that some arriving aircraft are not as loud as others and that the noisier operations seem to come in a series of six or seven. He concluded that noise from arriving aircraft is particularly bad in the morning.

LAWA representative Scott Tatro thanked the speaker for his comments and noted that LAWA staff would be providing a quick update on the downwind arrival noise study later in the meeting.

There were no additional public comments, so Chairman Schneider closed the public comment period.

4. Briefing on UC Davis Noise Symposium

Member Murray gave a brief presentation to the Roundtable regarding the recent U.C. Davis Aviation Noise and Air Quality Symposium held in Palm Springs, California. Mr. Murray said the conference was well attended and that the 30 sessions spanning three days were very interesting. Conference highlights included a keynote on electric aircraft by Erik Lindbergh, grandson of Charles Lindbergh, sessions on performance-based navigation (PBN) at Portland International Airport (PDX) and Phoenix Sky Harbor Airport (PHX), a presentation by Mr. Murray on net noise changes at John Wayne Airport attributed to implementation of PBN procedures, a Delta presentation on methods used to reduce noise and Delta's environmental/sustainability policy, and a Dallas Fort Worth (DFW) presentation about airport carbon accreditation.

Several members engaged in a brief discussion regarding information shared by Mr. Murray from the conference, noting that concerns expressed by communities in the vicinity of PHX are consistent with those expressed in the L.A. area about potential changes in noise related to the Southern California Metroplex project. Member Murray noted that the PHX presentation was focused primarily on lessons learned and the importance of a well-thought-out public involvement strategy.

The presentation regarding the UC Davis Noise Symposium can be found on the Roundtable webpage at <http://www.lawa.org/LAXNoiseRoundTable.aspx>.

5. FAA's Proposed Stage 5 Aircraft Noise Standard

Mr. Jones gave a presentation regarding the FAA's January 14, 2016 Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (NPRM) that would establish a Stage 5 noise standard for aircraft operating in the United States. The new noise standard would be cumulatively 17 decibels (dB) lower than the Stage 3 noise standard and 7 dB lower than the existing Stage 4 noise standard. If the new standard is adopted, aircraft noise standards in the U.S. would be consistent with the International Civil Aviation Organization's (ICAO) Chapter 14 noise standard which has been in effect since July 2014.

Per the NPRM, the Stage 5 noise standard would be effective on December 31, 2017 for new large subsonic jet aircraft with a maximum takeoff weight of 121,254 pounds or greater and on December 31, 2020 for regional jets and turboprop aircraft weighing less than 121,254 pounds. The NPRM does not include a proposed phase out schedule for Stage 3 or Stage 4 aircraft. Unrelated legislation introduced in December 2015 (H.R. 4171) would require a gradual phase out of Stage 3 aircraft by 2037 if it passes.

The proposed Stage 5 aircraft noise standard would raise the bar for aircraft noise reduction in the U.S. and synchronize U.S. aircraft noise standards with those of ICAO.

Mr. Jones suggested that if the Roundtable members agree, they could send a letter to the FAA supporting the adoption of the proposed Stage 5 noise standard and recommend that the final rulemaking include a Stage 3 aircraft phase-out schedule.

Roundtable members asked why the year 2037 was proposed as the Stage 3 aircraft phase out date in the Silent Skies Act and whether airlines would still be operating Stage 3 aircraft by that time, given most if not all of the Stage 3 aircraft would be retired from service before 2037. Mr. Jones indicated that he did not know why H.R. 4171 included a Stage 3 aircraft phase-out date of 2037, but noted that an earlier version of the bill failed during the last session of Congress. Airlines hold on to aircraft for a long time for business reasons, he said, but agreed that many Stage 3 aircraft will probably be retired by 2037.

After Roundtable discussion on this presentation, Chairman Schneider made a motion to send a letter to the FAA supporting the Stage 5 aircraft noise standard and recommending that the final rule include a phase-out schedule for Stage 3 aircraft. Roundtable Member Ghiya seconded the motion, which was approved unanimously.

The presentation on the FAA's Proposal of a Stage 5 Aircraft Noise Standard can be found on the Roundtable webpage at <http://www.lawa.org/LAXNoiseRoundTable.aspx>.

6. Work Program A12 – Status Update on A320 Outreach Efforts

Mr. Jones gave a progress report on Work Program A12 with reference to recommending airlines to install vortex generators on their A320 series aircraft to eliminate a particular noise problem associated with this aircraft series. He reminded the Roundtable members that researchers in Europe identified a high-pitched noise generated by the A320 as the aircraft descends for landing, caused by air flowing across open cavities under the wing. The noise, which can be heard several miles from the runway before the deployment of landing gear, can be mitigated with a small metal device (the vortex generator) that is placed in front of the open cavities. The vortex generator reduces approach noise by 2 to 6 dB. Airbus has been installing vortex generators on newly manufactured A320 aircraft since March 2014 and certain airlines (e.g., Lufthansa and Air France) are retrofitting their existing A320 aircraft that operate in Europe.

LAWA has tasked ESA with providing research assistance for this Work Program Item and has asked ESA to determine the feasibility and effectiveness of several A320 Vortex Generator Retrofit Strategies. Mr. Jones' update focused on four potential strategies:

- Obtaining Congressional funding support;
- Offering reduced landing fees;
- Partnering with an airline willing to serve in a champion role; and
- Partnering with another airport and focusing on one or two airlines.

ESA's research suggests that neither obtaining Congressional funding support nor offering reduced landing fees to airlines is likely to be a feasible/successful strategy. Both strategies could be costly to implement/administer and could be challenged as being discriminatory. The option of partnering with one or more airlines to establish a voluntary vortex generator retrofit program could be a cost-effective and feasible strategy, as would partnering with other airports and/or noise forums on this issue, which would allow LAWA to determine if broader support for this initiative exists.

A member asked why offering reduced landing fees to an airline that voluntarily retrofits its aircraft with vortex generators would be considered discriminatory. LAWA stated that FAA feedback suggests that such a program would likely be challenged by the FAA and airlines because the A320 aircraft already comply with all applicable federal noise certification requirements. There is no justification for providing financial incentives to one type of aircraft when it meets the same requirements as all of the other aircraft.

This work item will continue with updates at future Roundtable meetings.

The presentation on the A320 Vortex Generator can be found on the Roundtable webpage at <http://www.lawa.org/LAXNoiseRoundTable.aspx>.

7. Consideration of a Special Meeting for LAX North Arrival Analysis

LAWA staff member David Chan stated that LAWA has selected an independent noise consultant to perform a comprehensive analysis of the LAX north downwind arrivals to determine what changes, if any, have occurred with regard to flight paths, altitudes, flight procedures and other elements that may cause residents to notice an increase in flight activity and noise in areas along the north downwind arrival route. The results from this study are expected to be available in June 2016 and LAWA proposed a special meeting of the Roundtable on June 8, 2016 to share the findings with members of the Roundtable and the public.

Members asked LAWA to provide additional information regarding the north downwind arrival study and LAWA staff member Kathryn Pantoja provided details on the scope of the study. Ms. Pantoja stated that Steve Alverson of ESA helped develop the scope of work for the study which is being conducted by HMMH and noted that:

- The study area includes Pacific Palisades, Malibu, Santa Monica, Mar Vista, Culver City, and other communities
- The study is comparing flight track data from 2010 to 2015 to determine any changes in flight paths and altitudes

- The study is looking at modeled single-event noise levels, cumulative noise levels, and slant-range distance at key locations
- HMMH will be evaluating monthly and hourly variations in traffic volumes and noise levels and will be developing flight track density plots
- HMMH will review historical published arrival procedures to identify changes, if any
- HMMH will need sufficient time to conduct the study and will not have results until late May at the earliest

Member Murray inquired about various aspects of the scope of the HMMH study including the study area, specific noise model used for noise calculations, use of radar flight track data, meteorological data, and N60 metric for the study. Ms. Pantoja noted that HMMH will be using proprietary software (Real Contours) to perform the noise calculations and noted that every single aircraft flight track will be considered in the noise calculations. She stated that HMMH will be calculating sound exposure level (SEL) and community noise equivalent level (CNEL) values, but will not be using the N60 noise metric in the study or adding real weather data into the noise model. She offered to speak with Member Murray after the meeting about other aspects of the north downwind arrival study.

After this discussion, Member Cope made a motion to convene a special meeting of the Roundtable on June 8, 2016 to discuss the findings. Member Lehrman seconded the motion, which was approved unanimously.

8. LAX Part 150 Noise Exposure Map Update

Mr. Tatro gave a short briefing regarding the updated 14 CFR Part 150 Noise Exposure Maps for LAX. The FAA accepted the updated Noise Exposure Maps for LAX on February 18, 2016. The acceptance letter from the FAA indicates that the 2015 and 2020 noise exposure maps meet the requirements specified in Title 14 of the Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) Part 150. The contours depicted on the 2020 noise exposure map will now serve as the official program boundaries for the LAX sound insulation program, replacing the LAX Master Plan Alternative D noise contours, which were used through the end of 2015. LAWA and the jurisdictions surrounding LAX that implement the LAX sound insulation program made significant progress in 2015, particularly in Inglewood. Moving forward, LAWA will work with the participating jurisdictions to define the next phases of the program.

9. Review/Approve Roundtable Work Program

Mr. Chan indicated that he has updated the work program document to include work progress and accomplishments for the past year and briefly reviewed the following items with the Roundtable members:

- Item A1 has been updated to reflect Roundtable efforts regarding the FAA So Cal Metroplex Project such as reviewing the proposed flight procedures and submitting letters to FAA on the public comment period and Draft EA.
- Item A2 was revised to document the FAA's determination on the Part 161 study and to acknowledge that LAWA does not plan to pursue the proposed restriction any further.
- Item A6 was revised to note the FAA's support of extending the LOOP departure hours to include the period between 9 p.m. and midnight on a permanent basis,

based on the results of the LOOP Departure Test. The next step is for the FAA to prepare a NEPA CATEX.

- Item A12 was revised to note the efforts to date regarding the A320 vortex generator.
- Item B3 has been updated to reflect the fact that LAWA has identified two viable locations for a ground run-up enclosure (GRE) at LAX and that LAWA is moving forward with the environmental review for the two potential sites.

Members inquired about the GRE's location and whether LAWA was going to construct one or two GREs at LAX. LAWA conducted a GRE siting and feasibility study, which evaluated 12 potential sites, and identified two of the 12 as preferred sites for a potential GRE installation. The next step is to conduct a formal environmental review of the two preferred sites which may include options for one or two GREs.

Member Rubin stated that he would like LAWA and members of the Roundtable to consider adding air pollution topics to the Roundtable Work Program. He explained that the issues of noise pollution and air pollution are interrelated and that they should be evaluated together. Mr. Tatro replied that the Roundtable was established to address a single issue: aircraft noise.

Mr. Jones suggested that the Roundtable may want to consider deferring the approval of the work program to the next meeting to allow more time for the members to review the document. Chairman Schneider agreed and deferred the item to the next meeting.

10. Statistical Update on Aircraft Operations (Work Items A6, A8, and A7)

Mr. Chan quickly covered the statistical update for Loop Departures, Short Turn Arrivals, and Extended Downwind approaches.

LAX Loop Departures – On an annual basis, the number of LOOP Departures not meeting the minimum altitude is declining due to newer aircraft having improved climb performance. Most aircraft are at altitudes between 10,000 and 15,000 feet when they re-cross the shoreline, however, the number of aircraft flying under 10,000 feet at the shoreline tends to increase during the summer months when higher temperatures degrade aircraft climb performance.

Short Turn Arrivals – Short turn operations have been declining on an annual basis, reaching an all-time low in 2015. As traffic levels at LAX increase, short turn arrivals tend to decrease due to limited spacing available for aircraft to maneuver the short turn approach.

Extended Downwind Approaches – Extended Downwind Approaches correspond to the overall increase in traffic at LAX in recent years. The increase in 2015 is partly associated with the runway closures for the RSA project. Month-to-month statistics for the past 13 months showed that Extended Downwind Approaches were at high levels during the summer with weather and runway closures contributing to the increase. A comparison of the aircraft altitudes over Monterey Park for the month of January over the past three years indicated altitudes have remained much the same with the majority of aircraft flying between 2,400 and 4,000 feet.

The presentation containing the full Statistical Update on Aircraft Operations can be found on the Roundtable webpage at <http://www.lawa.org/LAXNoiseRoundTable.aspx>.

11. Aviation Noise News Update

The Roundtable members agreed to forgo the Aviation Noise News Update presentation in order to allow the meeting to end on time.

The complete Aviation Noise News Update can be found on the Roundtable webpage at <http://www.lawa.org/LAXNoiseRoundTable.aspx>.

12. Roundtable Member Discussion

Chairman Schneider asked if there were any additional items the Roundtable members wished to discuss.

After some discussion, the Roundtable approved a motion to send a letter to the FAA to follow up on previously submitted Roundtable letters regarding the FAA's Southern California Metroplex Project. However, since this item was not on the agenda, the motion must be reconsidered to satisfy the Brown Act requirements. If the Roundtable still wishes to send a letter to the FAA, this item can be added to the May meeting agenda for discussion and potential action. **Note:** Subsequent to the meeting, the FAA responded to LAWA indicating that the responses to the Roundtable letters will be included in the Final Environmental Assessment document for the Metroplex project as part of the official record.

13. Review of Roundtable Action Items

Mr. Jones reviewed the following Roundtable actions taken and member requests made during tonight's meeting:

Formal Action Items

The Roundtable unanimously approved a motion to send a letter to the FAA to express support for the proposed Stage 5 noise standard as described in the January 14, 2016 Notice of Proposed Rulemaking and to recommend that the final rule include a phase-out schedule for Stage 3 aircraft.

The Roundtable unanimously approved a motion to hold a special meeting of the Roundtable on June 8, 2016 to discuss the findings of the north downwind arrivals study.

The Roundtable deferred the approval of the Work Program document to the next meeting to allow sufficient time for members to review the document.

Requests from Members

There were no requests from Roundtable members.

14. Adjournment

Mr. Chan identified May 11, 2016 as the next Roundtable meeting date. He reminded the members that a special meeting of the Roundtable to discuss the downwind arrivals noise study being conducted by LAWA and its consultants will occur on June 8, 2016.

Chairman Schneider adjourned the meeting at 9:05 pm.