



## **LAX/COMMUNITY NOISE ROUNDTABLE**

Recap of the Regular Meeting of November 10, 2015

### **Roundtable Members Present**

Denny Schneider, Chairman, Westchester Neighbors Association  
Carl Jacobson, Vice Chairman, City of El Segundo  
Omar Pulido, City of Los Angeles – Council District 11  
Danna Cope, LAX Area Advisory Committee  
Martin Rubin, North Westdale Neighborhood Association  
Stephen Murray, City of Culver City  
Cesar Vega, City of Monterey Park  
Terry Boyle, Federal Aviation Administration  
Scott Tatro, LAWA

### **LAWA and Consultant Staff**

Kathryn Pantoja, LAWA  
René Spencer, LAWA  
David Chan, LAWA  
Christina Tigert, LAWA  
Maria Depaz, LAWA  
Joe Czech, Wyle, Inc.  
Steve Alverson, Roundtable Facilitator

A quorum of the members was present.

### **1. Welcome/Review of the Meeting Format**

Roundtable Facilitator Steve Alverson welcomed everyone to the meeting and reviewed the meeting format. Mr. Alverson indicated that the Roundtable meetings are facilitated in order to stay on topic and on schedule. He added that there would be a period for public comments and the Chairman may entertain questions from the audience as time permits.

## **2. Call to order**

Roundtable Chairman Denny Schneider called the meeting to order at 7:01 pm PST in the Samuel Greenberg Boardroom at LAX.

## **3. 15th Anniversary Celebration**

LAWA staff member David Chan noted that this year marked the Roundtable's 15<sup>th</sup> Anniversary and reviewed some of the Roundtable's recent progress in reducing aircraft noise. To celebrate the occasion, he said LAWA provided light appetizers, refreshments, and a cake with the Roundtable logo for the Roundtable members and the public to enjoy. He also distributed tote bags with the Roundtable logo to the members as a memento of the occasion. During the short break for refreshments, historical photos of past Roundtable meetings and noise abatement programs were shown on the screen.

## **4. Comments from the Public**

Chairman Schneider asked if there were any members of the public wishing to offer a comment. A resident of Mar Vista explained that since the day after Columbus Day, his neighborhood has experienced overflights by large aircraft arriving from the northwest. He said that the aircraft have been lower and louder than in the past and believes it may be the implementation of a new approach procedure.

A resident of Pacific Palisades expressed similar concerns regarding frequent low and loud aircraft since the Columbus Day weekend. She said that LAWA staff had said the increase in noise may have been caused by the humidity. She added that FAA representative Rob Henry said that it was not related to the Metroplex.

FAA representative Terry Boyle said that Metroplex has not begun yet and the staff at the Southern California TRACON (SCT) controls the air traffic over that area. The Roundtable asked Mr. Boyle to contact SCT staff to ask them to attend the January 13, 2016 Roundtable meeting to explain whether there has been a change in air traffic procedures over Mar Vista and Pacific Palisades.

## **5. Selection of One Roundtable Member to Attend UC Davis Aviation Noise**

Chairman Denny Schneider indicated that he understands the UC Davis Noise Symposium attendance is rotated between the LAX Roundtable and the LAX Area Advisory Committee for one member to attend the event each year. Since it is the Roundtable's turn to send a representative to the Symposium, he noted members Stephen Murray and Petra Schneider had expressed interest in attending and asked whether LAWA can cover the expenses for two members to attend the event. LAWA representatives indicated that the current LAWA policy would only cover one member but will look into the possibility of covering the expenses for two. After a short discussion, the Roundtable decided to send member Murray to the Symposium and designate member Schneider as an alternate.

Note: Member Petra Schneider subsequently notified LAWA that she will no longer be able to participate in the Roundtable as the City of Rancho Palos Verdes representative. As such, LAWA is proceeding to send only one member, Stephen Murray, to the Symposium.

## **6. Presentation on "The Pros and Cons of CNEL"**

Mr. Joe Czech of Wyle, Inc. gave a presentation on the Pros and Cons of the Community Noise Equivalent Level (CNEL) metric. He said that CNEL is used only in California and the Day-Night Average Sound Level (DNL) is used in the 49 other states. He explained that on the con side, CNEL is not a metric you can hear, the math is complicated, and it is based on the average daily operations, runway use, and flight track utilization. On the pro side, he said CNEL accounts for the way we hear by using the A-weighting network, is based on individual noise events, accounts for the time of day that the events occur, accounts for the number of events, and is a cumulative 24-hour metric. He provided two different examples of varying hourly noise levels and the resulting CNEL values. He concluded his presentation by stating that CNEL does a good job at quantifying aircraft noise, but additional research is needed in the area of both noise metrics and appropriate threshold levels.

The complete Pros and Cons of CNEL presentation can be found on the Roundtable webpage at <http://www.lawa.org/LAXNoiseRoundTable.aspx>.

## **7. Work Program A12 - Status Update on A320 Outreach Efforts**

Mr. Alverson provided an update on LAWA's outreach efforts regarding the A320 vortex generator. The vortex generator is a small metal device placed underneath the aircraft wings to deflect air flow and reduce the approach noise by 2 to 6 dB. Lufthansa and Air France have started retrofitting their existing A320 series aircraft operating in Europe. Statistics show that there were 937 A320 family aircraft in the U.S. airline fleet in 2014 and approximately 17 percent of all arrivals at LAX are comprised of A320 aircraft.

LAWA is collecting more information about the vortex generator prior to approaching the airlines to encourage them to install this device on their aircraft. LAWA has reached out to the Chicago O'Hare Noise Compatibility Commission regarding their efforts to encourage airlines to install the A320 vortex generator and discussed the cost of installing vortex generators with Airbus, Lufthansa, and the SFO Noise Management Office. In addition, LAWA is researching several A320 vortex generator retrofit implementation strategies including obtaining Congressional funding support, offering reduced landing fees to airlines undertaking a vortex generator retrofit, partnering with an airline willing to serve in a champion role, and partnering with another airport and focusing on one or two carriers that may be willing to undertake a retrofit program. LAWA will provide additional information regarding its progress to the Roundtable during a future briefing.

The complete Status Update on A320 Outreach Efforts presentation can be found on the Roundtable webpage at <http://www.lawa.org/LAXNoiseRoundTable.aspx>.

## **8. LAX Noise Complaints**

LAWA staff member Maria Depaz described the process LAWA uses to collect and analyze aircraft noise complaints. She explained that 80 percent of all noise complaints are received through the WebTrak system and the remaining 20 percent through the LAX and City of El Segundo noise complaint phone lines. LAWA's Noise Management staff investigates the first five complaints of every caller each month and provides written responses when requested to do so. Prior to conducting complaint investigations, staff reviews and cleans up the data in the Airport Noise and Operations Management System (ANOMS). LAWA staff then uses a variety of tools available in ANOMS such as pilot/controller communications recordings and flight track replay to investigate complaints and develop findings. The flight track data in ANOMS has some limitations including a lack of identification for some general

aviation aircraft and military operations. Information on certain private aircraft is also not available since some aircraft owners have requested FAA to block their identification information.

Monthly noise complaint statistics for January through September 2015 show an increase during the summer months when windows are open due to the hot weather conditions. One third of all complaints come from Monterey Park with one individual accounting for 99 percent of those complaints. In terms of type of disturbance reported, "loud noise" accounts for 51 percent of the complaints, while "overflight" accounts for 23 percent of the complaints. Ms. Depaz concluded her presentation by showing a map depicting the distribution of complaints throughout the Los Angeles Basin.

A member asked how complaints regarding air quality are handled. Ms. Depaz said the complainants are referred to the South Coast Air Quality Management District. A member commented that it would be interesting to see a "heat map" indicating where complaints occur. Another member noted that not everyone chooses to complain even though they are annoyed by the aircraft noise levels.

The complete LAX Noise Complaints presentation can be found on the Roundtable webpage at <http://www.lawa.org/LAXNoiseRoundTable.aspx>.

## 9. Statistical Update on Aircraft Operations

LAWA staff member David Chan presented the statistical update for Work Program Items A9 and A10. The following is a summary of Mr. Chan's presentation.

### Work Program Item A9: Departures on Runway 25L

**Description: Aircraft departing from Runway 25L create noise disturbances to the communities south of LAX, especially during nighttime hours.**

Recent annual statistics show that most of the departures on the south complex at LAX occurred on the inboard runway (25R). Statistics for the most recent 13-month period include an uptick in outboard runway 25L departures in April 2015 due to temporary closures of Runway 25R. Runway closures limit the availability of runways at LAX for aircraft operations. In most cases, when the inboard runway 25R is closed, aircraft will have to use the outboard runway 25L for departure and vice versa.

Aircraft Design Group VI aircraft such as the A380 and the B747-8 are not able to depart on Runway 25R at LAX due to limited spacing between Runway 25R and Taxiway B. These large aircraft can depart only on either 25L on the south complex or 24L on the north complex. During the night from 12 am to 6:30 am for September 2015, there were some departures occurring on Runway 25L even though no closure activity existed on Runway 25R. These departures were the ADG VI aircraft.

During the day, there is more traffic and it is more challenging for the FAA to assign aircraft for departure on the inboard runway, especially general aviation and cargo aircraft, which would need to cross two active runways since their facilities are located on the south side of the airport. Despite this challenge, the FAA managed to assign more general aviation and cargo aircraft departures on runway 25R than on Runway 25L.

FedEx, which has the most cargo operations at LAX, made a commitment to ask its pilots to request Runway 25R for departures. Statistics show a gradual decrease of Fed Ex departures on Runway 25L with a gradual increase of departures on 25R.

### **Work Program Item A10: Turboprop Community Overflights**

**Description: Turboprop aircraft departing to the west/southwest with destinations to the east overfly the Palos Verdes Peninsula and Torrance en route to the Seal Beach VOR.**

Annual statistics comparing southbound turboprop departures to those overflying the Palos Verdes Peninsula have changed very little during the past five years. Since March of 2015 there has been a steady reduction in the number of southbound turboprop departures as SkyWest Airlines is phasing turboprop aircraft out of its fleet at LAX. The majority of the turboprop aircraft are between 7,000 to 9,000 feet over the Peninsula. SkyWest had the most turboprop overflights of the Peninsula, but that number is declining as SkyWest phases out its turboprop aircraft.

The annual jet overflights of the Peninsula from 2010 to 2014 account for a very small percentage of the total southbound jet departures. Most jet aircraft are at or above 13,000 feet when passing over the Peninsula.

Mr. Chan's presentation on the Statistical Update on Aircraft Operations can be found on the Roundtable webpage at <http://www.lawa.org/LAXNoiseRoundTable.aspx>.

## **10. Aviation Noise News Update**

Mr. Alverson reviewed several recent aviation noise news items for the Roundtable including the following articles:

- A six-month extension of the FAA funding bill, which should prevent any interruptions to AIP grant funding.
- Pratt & Whitney's new PurePower Geared Turbofan engine, which burns less fuel and is quieter than other jet aircraft engines, is scheduled to enter service before the end of 2015.
- A study investigating the relationship between exposure to aircraft noise near three airports in France and mortality from cardiovascular disease, coronary heart disease, and myocardial infarction.
- Proposed congressional legislation that, if passed, would require the U.S. EPA to study and report to Congress about the effectiveness of the FAA's efforts to mitigate the impact of aircraft noise.
- The Santa Clara County Board of Supervisors approved a resolution calling on the FAA to address increased aircraft noise levels attributable to changes in flight paths to San Francisco Bay Area airports related to the Northern California Metroplex.
- Airbus delivered an A350-900 aircraft to Finnair on Wednesday, October 7, 2015 and stated it is on track to deliver fifteen A350-900 aircraft this year.
- The final flight of a US Airways aircraft marking the full integration of US Airways into American Airlines.

The complete Aviation Noise News Update can be found on the Roundtable webpage at <http://www.lawa.org/LAXNoiseRoundTable.aspx>.

## 11. Roundtable Member Discussion

Member Murray asked if LAWA could use a supplemental metric to help clarify what Culver City residents are hearing. LAWA representative Scott Tatro said that LAWA is required to use CNEL to quantify aircraft noise exposure and has used supplemental metrics in other studies including sleep disturbance in the LAX Part 161 study. Mr. Tatro added that it is not clear what problem the Roundtable is trying to address with such an effort.

A member asked if LAWA has seen an upswing in noise complaints from other communities under the north downwind. Ms. Pantoja said there were no big increases at that time. Mr. Tatro added that given the amount of attention that has been paid to the issue in Culver City, it is not surprising to see noise complaints in Culver City have gone up.

Chairman Schneider requested that LAWA provide an update on the FAA's ongoing noise metric study at a future meeting. Note: The study is referring to FAA's survey of communities around 20 U.S. airports to document public perceptions of aircraft noise and to determine whether to update the FAA's methods for determining exposure to noise.

## 12. Review of Roundtable Action Items

Mr. Alverson reviewed the following Roundtable actions taken and member requests made during tonight's meeting:

### Formal Action Items

The Roundtable approved sending Culver City representative Stephen Murray to the 2016 UC Davis Noise Symposium in Palm Springs and approved designating Rancho Palos Verdes representative Petra Schneider as the alternate if Mr. Murray is unable to attend.

### Requests from Members

The Roundtable asked LAWA to investigate if it would be possible to send two Roundtable members to the UC Davis Noise Symposium. *Note: LAWA is proceeding to send only one member, Stephen Murray, to the Symposium since the other member, Petra Schneider, subsequently notified LAWA that she will no longer be able to participate in the Roundtable as the City of Rancho Palos Verdes representative.*

Roundtable members asked FAA Representative Terry Boyle to contact the Southern California TRACON to arrange for a representative to attend the next Roundtable meeting to discuss the LAX north arrival path that affects Pacific Palisades, Santa Monica, and Mar Vista.

Chairman Schneider requested that LAWA provide an update on the FAA's ongoing noise metric study at a future meeting. Note: The study is referring to FAA's survey of communities around 20 U.S. airports to document public perceptions of aircraft noise and to determine whether to update the FAA's methods for determining exposure to noise.

## 13. Adjournment

LAWA staff member Chan identified January 13, 2016 as the next Roundtable meeting date. Chairman Schneider adjourned the meeting at 9:10 pm.