



LAX/COMMUNITY NOISE ROUNDTABLE

Recap of the Regular Meeting of March 11, 2015

Roundtable Members Present

Denny Schneider, Chairman, Westchester Neighbors Association
Carl Jacobson, Vice Chairman, City of El Segundo
Blake LaMar, City of Palos Verdes Estates
Danna Cope, LAX Area Advisory Committee
Yvonne Bedford, Ladera Heights Civic Association
JoAnn Williams, United Homeowners Association
Martin Rubin, North Westdale Neighborhood Association
June Lehrman, City of Culver City
Chris Arriola, City of Monterey Park
Olivia Valentine, City of Hawthorne
Rolan Morel, Federal Aviation Administration
Scott Tatro, LAWA

LAWA, Airline, and Consultant Staff

Kathryn Pantoja, LAWA
René Spencer, LAWA
David Chan, LAWA
Steve Alverson, Roundtable Facilitator

A quorum of the members was present.

1. Welcome/Review of the Meeting Format

Roundtable Facilitator Steve Alverson welcomed everyone to the meeting and reviewed the meeting format. Mr. Alverson indicated that the Roundtable meetings are facilitated in order to stay on topic and on schedule. He added that there would be a period for public comments and the Chair may entertain questions from the audience as time permits.

2. Call to order

Roundtable Chairman Denny Schneider called the meeting to order at 7:00 pm PST in the Samuel Greenberg Boardroom at LAX.

3. Comments from the Public

Chairman Schneider opened the public comment period. A resident of Culver City noted that she was at a meeting on aircraft noise in Culver City two weeks ago. She said that there were many longtime residents at the meeting who expressed concern about aircraft noise. She explained that she bought a home in Carlson Park and began noticing aircraft overflights after moving in. She indicated that a very large jet overflying her house during a party had stopped the conversations. Her friends asked if she lived under a flight path. She added that the overflights are frequent; occurring every eight minutes with quiet periods in between each aircraft. She indicated she has installed new windows and insulation in her home, but that does not make her backyard quiet. She expressed concern that the overflights could be a community deterrent. She asked how the Roundtable interacts with the FAA.

Culver City's Alternate Roundtable Member, Stephen Murray, noted that he attended the same meeting in Culver City two weeks ago and wanted to thank Chairman Schneider and LAWA representative Scott Tatro for attending.

Chairman Schneider expressed his appreciation for the speaker's comments regarding aircraft noise in Culver City and said that all of the key people who could address their aircraft noise concerns were in the room this evening.

A Culver City resident of 17 years said that he is very aware of his noise environment and about one and a half years ago aircraft noise increased. He said aircraft noise is now the first sound he hears in the morning and last sound he hears at night with overflights occurring every four minutes. He said he understands that LAWA has indicated that there has been no quantifiable change in aircraft altitudes over Culver City, but he believes the aircraft are flying lower over his house. He asked how long the aircraft flight path had been in its current location. He suggested that the aircraft flight path be moved over the 10 freeway. He said he would be open to other suggestions that would restore the peace and tranquility to his neighborhood.

LAWA representative Scott Tatro thanked the Culver City residents for attending the Roundtable meeting this evening. He said that LAWA wants to be transparent on aircraft noise issues. He said that LAWA previously reviewed the aircraft altitudes over Culver City and did not find any noticeable changes. He noted that LAWA provided the findings and the altitude data to Culver City representative June Lehrman. Scott added that he has worked for LAWA at LAX since 1994 and that the north downwind arrival flight path that passes over Culver City has been in the same location for at least 21 years. He noted that the Roundtable has not addressed the Culver City noise issue in a formal way and asked whether the Roundtable wanted to make it a Work Program item.

FAA representative Rolan Morel said that he was not aware of any changes to the north downwind arrival flight path at LAX.

Member Williams said that she agrees with what the Culver City residents have been saying. She added that her neighborhood has been receiving much more aircraft noise 24/7, with longtime residents noticing a change in the aircraft noise levels.

Member Lehrman said that although the FAA has said the flight path has not changed, Member Williams' neighborhood is experiencing the same thing as Culver City, just lower.

She added that she met with Congresswoman Karen Bass' aid Judith Hamilton. Ms. Lehrman suggested that affected community members should reach out to Congresswoman Bass.

Member Rubin suggested that as a part of the airspace redesign process, the FAA should consider raising the altitude of the north downwind and aligning the flight track with the 10 Freeway.

As there were no additional requests by the public to provide comments, Chairman Schneider closed the public comment period.

4. Welcome New Member

LAWA staff member David Chan said that he had received a letter from the City of Hawthorne appointing Mayor Pro Tem Olivia Valentine as its Roundtable representative and Mayor Chris Brown as the alternate. Mr. Chan asked the Roundtable to welcome Member Valentine to the Roundtable. He said he prepared Roundtable membership binders for Ms. Valentine and Mr. Brown and noted that they will begin receiving the Airport Noise Report.

Ms. Valentine told the Roundtable that she was happy to serve as Hawthorne's Roundtable representative. She added that she also serves on the LAX Area Advisory Committee and that she retired as an FAA attorney in 2007.

5. Consideration of United Homeowners Association's request for Re-appointment to Roundtable Membership

Chairman Schneider acknowledged the receipt of a letter from United Homeowners Association appointing JoAnn Williams as its representative on the Roundtable. Given Member Williams' status as a longtime Roundtable member, Chairman Schneider re-appointed Ms. Williams to the Roundtable without any objection by members.

6. Work Program Item A6 – Status Update on LOOP Departure Test

LAWA representative Scott Tatro noted that FAA representatives from the Southern California TRACON had planned to provide an update on the testing of the LOOP departure from 9 p.m. to Midnight, but they were unable to attend tonight's meeting. Mr. Tatro said that he would present an update on the FAA's behalf. He said the FAA issued a Categorical Exclusion under the National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA) to conduct a six-month test, extending the use of the LOOP departure to include the period between 9 p.m. and midnight, while raising the required altitude for re-crossing the shoreline from 10,000 feet to 12,000 feet above mean sea level (MSL) during that time period.

Mr. Tatro said the FAA commenced the test on October 1, 2014 and concluded it on January 31, 2015. He noted that between four and 27 aircraft per night were placed on the LOOP Departure during the extended hours. He said that LAWA received several noise complaints before and during the LOOP departure test.

Based on the results of the test, the FAA's Air Traffic Control Tower, So Cal TRACON, and Los Angeles Center facilities support extending the LOOP departure hours to include the period between 9 p.m. and midnight on a permanent basis. He said that the FAA would

prepare a formal categorical exclusion to obtain environmental approval prior to implementing the change on a permanent basis.

Chairman Schneider said that the implementation of the LOOP Departure many years ago illustrates how the FAA has worked with the Roundtable to solve aircraft noise problems. He noted that the original problem was low departures crossing back over the shoreline above residential areas, which generated complaints from residents of the beach communities. He noted that the LOOP Departure provided a solution by focusing the return path directly over the airport at or above 10,000 feet.

Member Cope asked if the altitude at which LOOP departures cross back over the shoreline would drop back down to 10,000 feet MSL after midnight. Mr. Tatro clarified that there are no LOOP Departures between midnight and 7 am due to over ocean operations. Member Cope asked if aircraft are required to maintain runway heading when they turn back toward the airport. Members indicated that as aircraft turn back toward the airport, they are aiming at the LAX VOR while continuing to fly in a northeast direction.

Member Williams wanted to confirm whether the FAA intends to move forward of operating the LOOP Departures permanently on the extended hours (9pm to midnight). Mr. Tatro said that FAA must complete a NEPA categorical exclusion first before it can implement the procedure permanently. Inglewood Aviation Commission member Jim Withrow asked, now that the test is over, what will happen in the interim. Mr. Tatro said the use of the LOOP Departure will revert to 7 a.m. to 9 p.m. Culver City Alternate Roundtable Member Stephen Murray asked if there is any way to track the categorical exclusion process. Mr. Tatro said that there is no formal requirement for public outreach in the categorical exclusion process. Chairman Schneider suggested that the FAA should provide an update on the categorical exclusion process at the May Roundtable meeting. Mr. Tatro said that LAWA can ask the FAA to provide a presentation.

The complete LOOP Departure Test presentation can be found on the Roundtable webpage at <http://www.lawa.org/LAXNoiseRoundTable.aspx>.

7. Work Program Item A2 – Briefing concerning FAA Determination on the LAX Part 161 Application

Mr. Tatro provided a brief explanation of the origin of the FAR Part 161 process, which resulted from the 1990 Airport Noise and Capacity Act (ANCA). He explained that ANCA provided for the phase out of large Stage 2 jets by the year 2000 and in return, the FAA made it very difficult for airport proprietors to enact local aircraft noise restrictions. He said that the FAR Part 161 is a very arduous process designed to prevent new noise restrictions at airports. He noted that the benefit of the local noise restriction must outweigh the costs of the restriction as determined by the FAA. He added that there have been no restrictions on Stage 3 aircraft operations approved by the FAA since ANCA went into effect.

Mr. Tatro said that at the recommendation of the LAX Roundtable, LAWA undertook the FAR Part 161 process in an attempt to restrict east departures at LAX during west flow or over ocean operations. Mr. Tatro explained that over ocean operations are very effective in keeping aircraft noise over the ocean between midnight and 6:30 a.m. Member Lehrman asked why, since using over ocean operations is effective at controlling aircraft noise between midnight and 6:30 a.m., it wasn't used all the time. Mr. Tatro explained that over ocean operations can only be performed when aircraft operations levels are low. Member

LaMar indicated that the International Airline Pilots Association had designated LAX as a “black star airport” due to the head-to-head operations. Chairman Schneider asked whether over ocean operations would be affected by the Runway Safety Area (RSA) projects. Mr. Tatro said that LAX will continue to use over ocean operations during the RSA construction.

Mr. Tatro explained that in its Part 161 application to the FAA, LAWA explained that voluntary restrictions were not effective in eliminating east departures during west flow. He explained that over a 10-year period, there was an average of 65 east departures per year during west flow or over ocean operations. He said that while this seems like a relatively small number, each east departure at night disturbs thousands of residents. He said the FAR Part 161 application indicated that, to eliminate this nighttime noise disturbance, the City of Los Angeles would enact an ordinance to prevent non-conforming east departures from occurring at night.

He explained that in order to quantify the benefits of the restriction, LAWA examined the Community Noise Equivalent Level (CNEL), estimated the impacted population, analyzed noise complaints, and calculated sleep disturbance using the method prescribed by the American National Standards Institute (ANSI). He said that the 65 CNEL contour showed a slight reduction with the proposed restriction in place. He added that a plot of noise complaints on a map during east departures indicated a concentration in the South Bay with most of them outside the 65 CNEL contour. He noted that the Part 161 analysis indicated that thousands of people would experience less sleep disruption due to aircraft noise if the proposed restriction were implemented. He said the cost to the airlines would include offloading passengers and cargo in order to meet the maximum takeoff weight requirements for departing to the west.

Mr. Tatro said that it took ten years from the concept of the proposed restriction in 2001 to preparing the draft ordinance text in 2011. In 2013, LAWA submitted the application to FAA and received a number of comments regarding deficiencies in the application. LAWA rectified the deficiencies and on June 10, 2014, the FAA deemed the application complete. Mr. Tatro explained that the FAA reviews the application in the context of six conditions that must be met in order for the FAA to approve the application. He said that in its determination letter, the FAA found that three of the conditions were satisfied and three were not. As a result, he said the FAA denied LAWA’s application for the restriction.

Mr. Tatro indicated that the FAA found that LAWA’s definition of the noise problem was “arbitrary,” that there was not substantial evidence that the proposed restriction could relieve LAX’s noise problem, that the restriction conflicted with federal statutes and would lead to unsafe operations.

Chairman Schneider praised LAWA for making the effort to go through the FAR Part 161 process to seek approval for the restriction.

Member Rubin said that Congress should weigh in on how aircraft noise affects people on the ground. Mr. Tatro noted that Congress passed ANCA in order to prevent these types of restrictions from being enacted. A Culver City resident asked, since the Part 161 Study took 11 years and resulted in no change, whether there was any hope in resolving aircraft noise issues. Chairman Schneider said that the Roundtable members would not be at the table if there were no hope.

The complete LAX FAR Part 161 presentation can be found on the Roundtable webpage at <http://www.lawa.org/LAXNoiseRoundTable.aspx>.

8. Statistical Update on Aircraft Operations

Mr. Chan reviewed the annual aircraft operations at LAX from 1994 through 2014. He noted that total passengers using LAX reached 70.6 million in 2014, surpassing the previous high of 67.3 million in 2000. He added that aircraft operations in 2014 were approximately 636,000, which are down from the high of approximately 783,000 in 2000. He explained that the airlines are carrying more people per flight and that the average aircraft size is getting larger. He said that as a result, the airlines at LAX are carrying more passengers with fewer operations than in previous years.

Work Program Item A6: Improperly Flown LOOP Departures

Description: The LOOP departure procedure directs aircraft on westerly departures to turn back and re-cross the shoreline at the LAX VOR at or above 10,000 ft. to head to eastern destinations.

Mr. Chan reviewed LOOP departures that did not meet the minimum altitude requirement of 10,000 ft. at the shoreline. He noted that these statistics did not include LOOP operations that were part of the FAA's LOOP Departure Test. He said that on an annual basis the number of LOOP Departures not meeting the minimum altitude is declining due to newer aircraft having improved climb performance. He then reviewed the monthly statistics for the past 13 months and noted there is a recurring trend with the loop operations: the number of aircraft flying under 10,000 ft. at the shoreline tends to increase during the summer months when temperatures are higher, which degrades aircraft climb performance. Mr. Chan noted that most aircraft are at altitudes between 10,000 and 15,000 feet when they re-cross the shoreline.

Mr. Chan stated that SkyWest Airlines has the most LOOP Departures that did not reach the 10,000-ft minimum, which may be due to Skywest's fleet mix. He said he would need to investigate the issue further.

Work Program Item A8: Aircraft Arrivals Outside Regular Approach Paths (Short Turns)

Description: The Short Turn procedure refers to jet arrivals on the north downwind leg that turn to base leg and final prior to reaching the Harbor Freeway. This operation usually increases when a high-visibility condition exists and/or when the north arrival traffic is light. Conversely, Short Turn operations decrease when there is an increase in traffic and/or when there is a low-visibility condition. The short turn is also inversely related to the Extended Downwind Approach.

Mr. Chan indicated that since 2009, Short Turn operations have been declining on an annual basis reaching an all-time low in 2014. He said the monthly trends show Short Turns are at the lowest level during the June Gloom periods of low visibility. He presented a graphic showing the short turn flight tracks to give the members a better idea of which communities are affected. He noted that most aircraft on the short turn approach flew east of Windsor Hills at an altitude of approximately 2,000 to 3,000 feet MSL. He explained that in

most cases there were no Short Turns between midnight and 6:30 a.m. due to over ocean operations. Mr. Chan explained that SkyWest has the most Short Turns because it has the most arrivals from the north.

Work Program Item A7: Extended Downwind Approach

Description: Aircraft arriving to LAX from the west and the north utilize an Extended Downwind Approach at times causing aircraft to overfly Monterey Park and neighboring communities at low altitudes. Usually, the greater the number of north arrivals, the greater the need for aircraft to travel further east on the downwind leg. Weather conditions that produce low visibility can also cause this operation to increase as the FAA would need to increase the separation distance between aircraft for safety.

Mr. Chan reviewed the annual trends for the Extended Downwind Approach noting an increasing trend since 2009. He noted that Extended Downwind Approaches were at their highest in June due to the low visibility conditions. He explained that there is an inverse relationship between Short Turns and Extended Downwind Approaches. He said when one is up the other is down. He provided a comparison of flight tracks on two different days: January 6, 2015 when arrivals were typical for good visibility conditions and January 15, 2015 when low visibility caused Extended Downwind Approaches and overflights of Monterey Park. He indicated that SkyWest has the most Extended Downwind Approaches because it has the most arrivals from the north.

Mr. Withrow asked if aircraft could extend as far east as the 605 Freeway. Mr. Chan said that they could. Mr. Murray noted that aircraft are overflying the Santa Monica VOR at 7,000 feet which is 30 miles from touchdown at LAX. He said that if aircraft are supposed to be on a three-degree approach, aircraft are lower than they should be at the SMO VOR. Member Lehrman said that perhaps the complaint data from Culver City should be reviewed to see if the complaints are resulting from aircraft making Short Turns. Mr. Murray asked if the altitude at the SMO VOR could be raised to 10,000 feet. Mr. Morel said that the three-degree glide slope only applies to aircraft that are on the final approach. He added that the LAX airspace is very complex, with aircraft above and below the north downwind leg. He said it is not possible to raise the altitude over the SMO VOR without affecting other operations. He also said that the Short Turns are used in order to fit an aircraft into the final approach course. He explained that when there is an opening in the arrival stream, the controllers at SCT will try to fill those slots.

The complete presentation on the Statistical Update on Aircraft Operations can be found on the Roundtable webpage at <http://www.lawa.org/LAXNoiseRoundTable.aspx>.

9. Work Program Item A7 – Discussion of Monterey Park’s Request for a Noise Study

Member Arriola said that the City of Monterey Park is requesting that LAWA consider updating the 1998 aircraft noise measurement report that quantified aircraft noise levels in Monterey Park. He explained that there are more flights, increased extended turns, and new aircraft since the 1998 study was completed. He said given these changes, a noise study is needed to determine the magnitude of the noise problem in Monterey Park. Chairman Schneider said that Monterey Park is not currently within the 65 CNEL contour, but operations at LAX are forecast to reach one million by 2030.

Mr. Tatro said he appreciated Monterey Park making the request and explained that the 1998 Noise Study was made in support of an FAA task force studying noise levels in two locations: Palos Verdes and Monterey Park. Mr. Tatro acknowledged that many years have gone by since the previous noise study and while there have been changes in the aircraft fleet mix, operations are less than the peak that was reached in 2000. He added that the 65 CNEL contour is in about the same location as it was in 1998.

Mr. Tatro said that an additional factor to consider is the FAA's implementation of the Metroplex procedures. He explained that LAWA would want to know if the Roundtable's concerns, which included Extended Downwind Approaches, have been addressed through the Metroplex process. Mr. Tatro said that at a minimum, it would be prudent to wait until the Metroplex EA has been released before trying to update the 1998 Noise Report.

Member Arriola said he understands that the implementation of the Metroplex is a complicating factor, concurred that it would be best to wait until the release of the Metroplex EA, and appreciates LAWA's consideration of Monterey Park's request.

10. Aviation Noise News Update

Mr. Alverson reviewed several recent Aviation Noise News items for the Roundtable including articles:

- On statements by Boeing's Jim McNerney indicating that low fuel prices have not affected airlines' plans to purchase Boeing's fuel-efficient airplanes.
- Noting the significant increase in aircraft noise complaints by Phoenix residents after the implementation of NextGen procedures at Phoenix Sky Harbor International Airport.
- Regarding a letter to the FAA Administrator Michael Huerta from seven aviation groups urging the FAA to use a science-based approach to develop aviation noise policy.
- On the FAA Administrator's testimony before Congress describing FAA's long-term funding needs.
- On proposed legislation in Illinois to establish a noise hotline, collect aircraft noise levels, and develop CNEL contours for aircraft operations at Chicago O'Hare International Airport.
- On FAA's announcement regarding its approach to implementing the CatEx2 Net Noise Reduction method for Categorical Exclusions for PBN procedures.
- On the formation of Our Skies National Coalition, a coalition of anti-aircraft noise groups from across the United States.

The complete Aviation Noise News Update can be found on the Roundtable webpage at <http://www.lawa.org/LAXNoiseRoundTable.aspx>.

11. Roundtable Member Discussion

Mr. Chan provided a brief update on LAWA's efforts to gather more information regarding the A-320 vortex generator. He indicated that LAWA has learned that Lufthansa spent a mid-range single digit million Euros to retrofit all of its 157 A-319 and A-320 aircraft with the vortex generator. He added that Lufthansa receives a 40 percent discount on landing fees for the retrofitted aircraft at Frankfurt Airport in Germany. Mr. Chan noted that this is

definitely an incentive for Lufthansa to install the vortex generator on its fleets since Lufthansa is receiving a good return on its investment.

Chairman Schneider announced that LAWA's Executive Director Gina Marie Lindsey will be retiring. He said that Ms. Lindsey has been an ardent supporter of the Roundtable during her tenure. He suggested that the Roundtable send a letter to Ms. Lindsey thanking her for her support over the years and wishing her well on future endeavors.

12. Review of Roundtable Action Items

Mr. Alverson reviewed the following Roundtable actions taken and member requests made during tonight's meeting:

Formal Action Items

The Roundtable approved the request from United Homeowners Association to continue its Roundtable membership for another two-year term.

The Roundtable approved sending a letter to LAWA Executive Director Gina Marie Lindsey, thanking her for her support of the Roundtable and wishing her well in her future endeavors.

Requests from Members

Roundtable Chairman Denny Schneider requested that LAWA ask the FAA to provide a presentation regarding the categorical exclusion process for extending Loop Departures between 9 p.m. and midnight indefinitely.

Monterey Park representative Chris Arriola requested that LAWA conduct a noise study in Monterey Park that is similar to the previous noise study done in 1998. LAWA representative Scott Tatro indicated that it may be appropriate to wait for the results of the FAA's Metroplex project since the Roundtable had previously submitted recommendations to the FAA regarding the Monterey Park aircraft overflight issue for FAA's consideration in the Metroplex project. Member Arriola agreed with LAWA's approach on this matter.

13. Adjournment

LAWA staff member David Chan identified May 13, 2015 as the next Roundtable meeting date. Chairman Schneider adjourned the meeting at 8:57 pm.