



## **LAX/COMMUNITY NOISE ROUNDTABLE**

Recap of the Regular Meeting of January 14, 2015

### **Roundtable Members Present**

Denny Schneider, Chairman, Westchester Neighbors Association  
Carl Jacobson, Vice Chairman, City of El Segundo  
Blake LaMar, City of Palos Verdes Estates  
Petra Schneider, City of Rancho Palos Verdes  
Jessica Duboff, City of Los Angeles – Council District 11  
Danna Cope, LAX Area Advisory Committee  
Yvonne Bedford, Ladera Heights Civic Association  
Martin Rubin, North Westdale Neighborhood Association  
June Lehrman, City of Culver City  
Rolan Morel, Federal Aviation Administration  
Kathryn Pantoja, LAWA

### **LAWA and Consultant Staff**

David Chan, LAWA  
Steve Alverson, Roundtable Facilitator

A quorum of the members was present.

### **1. Welcome/Review of the Meeting Format**

Roundtable Facilitator Steve Alverson welcomed everyone to the meeting and reviewed the meeting format. Mr. Alverson indicated that the Roundtable meetings are facilitated in order to stay on topic and on schedule. He said there would be a period for public comment and Chairman Schneider may take questions during the meeting on specific topics.

### **2. Call to order**

Roundtable Chairman Denny Schneider called the meeting to order at 7:00 pm PST in the Samuel Greenberg Boardroom at LAX.

### **3. Comments from the Public**

Chairman Schneider opened the public comment period. A resident who lives on the north end of Manhattan Beach said that she has recently been awakened by low flying aircraft. Roundtable Facilitator Steve Alverson asked whether she filed a noise complaint with LAWA. She said she has not because she wasn't sure who to call. Mr. Alverson explained that by providing specific date and time information in a noise complaint, LAWA staff may be able to identify the cause of the event. He also mentioned that LAWA's WebTrak system affords residents the opportunity to view and investigate aircraft overflights on their own. She was provided the LAX noise hotline number.

A new resident of El Segundo who lives near the intersection of Palm and Hillcrest said she is hearing aircraft noise every two minutes beginning around 12:30 am. She asked if aircraft were allowed to fly over that area. LAWA representative Kathryn Pantoja said that from a noise abatement standpoint, the preference is for west departures to turn after passing the shoreline. She added that while a few aircraft turn early, most do not. She added that it would be easy to perceive the aircraft as being over the neighborhood even though they are not. She said that during Over Ocean Operations, most departures occur on the south runway complex. FAA representative Rolan Morel added that the FAA will normally turn aircraft no sooner than the shoreline, but may need to turn aircraft early to maintain aircraft separation requirements. With no additional attendees wishing to make public comment at that time, Chairman Schneider closed the public comment period.

Prior to Item 10 on the agenda, Chairman Schneider reopened the public comment period for a resident of Culver City who said that he has noticed a huge increase in aircraft noise. He noted that a few years ago the aircraft were higher and quieter over Culver City than they are now. He said the aircraft noise is very disruptive now and he can read the lettering on the aircraft. He said that increased aircraft noise has become the hot topic in Culver City. He would like to find answers as to why aircraft noise has increased over Culver City. Chairman Schneider closed the public comment period.

### **4. Appointment/Confirmation of At-Large Members for a Two-Year Term from January 2015 to December 2016**

Mr. Chan said that the Roundtable Bylaws require that every two years the at-large members submit a letter of interest indicating their desire to remain on the Roundtable. He noted that he received letters of interest from Westchester Neighbors Association, North Westdale Neighborhood Association, and Ladera Heights Civic Association.

He indicated that he had not received letters of interest from several previous at-large members including: Southeast Torrance Homeowners Association (SETHA), United Homeowners Association, and Peninsula Aircraft Noise and Safety Information Committee (PANIC). He explained that SETHA representative John Bailey indicated that due to insurance requirements his organization did not meet the minimum meeting requirements in the Roundtable Bylaws and would not be submitting a letter of interest. Mr. Chan said that United Homeowners Representatives JoAnn Williams was out of town, but intends to submit a letter of interest. He noted that he has not been contacted by any representatives of PANIC since representative Beverly Ackerson passed away last year.

Chairman Schneider called for a motion to accept all three of the at-large entities that had submitted letters of interest. Member Cope's motion to accept all three at-large entities was seconded by member Jacobson and approved unanimously by the Roundtable.

Chairman Schneider said that the Roundtable would consider United Homeowners Association's membership at such time as it submits a letter of interest. He also asked that the Roundtable discuss at its next meeting the portion of the Bylaws that requires community groups to hold regular meetings in order to be considered for at-large seats.

## **5. Confirmation of November 2015 Meeting Date**

Mr. Chan noted that the November 11, 2015 Roundtable meeting (regularly scheduled on the second Wednesday of each odd-numbered month) falls on the Veteran's Day holiday. He suggested that the Roundtable set the meeting date for November 10, 2015. After some discussion, the November meeting date was set by Chairman Schneider as November 10, 2015 without objection.

## **6. LAX Noise Exposure Map Update**

Acting in his role as Project Manager of the LAX FAR Part 150 Noise Exposure Map (NEM) Update, Mr. Alverson briefed the Roundtable on the study's progress to date. He reviewed the milestones that had been completed, including the collection and processing of all of the noise model inputs and land use data, and the FAA's approval of the Integrated Noise Model aircraft type substitutes. He noted that two public workshops and three briefings of the Roundtable had been conducted. He added that the draft 2015 and 2020 Community Noise Equivalent Level contours have been prepared. He said that a Preliminary Screen Check Draft NEM Report had been prepared and submitted to LAWA for review.

Mr. Alverson highlighted upcoming milestones including the incorporation of LAWA's comments as appropriate into a Draft NEM Report that will be submitted to FAA for review. He also noted that there will be an additional detailed briefing of the Roundtable, tentatively scheduled for the March meeting, as well as two more public workshops. He said the actual dates will be set and publicized well in advance of the meetings. He noted the overall goal of the project is the receive FAA's acceptance of the updated NEMs in 2015.

The presentation updating the Roundtable on the progress of the LAX FAR Part 150 NEM update is available for review in the Presentations section of the Roundtable webpage: <http://www.lawa.org/LAXNoiseRoundTable.aspx>.

## **7. Status Update on A320 Outreach Efforts**

Mr. Chan noted that LAWA had taken on the task of contacting the airlines, aircraft manufacturer, and other Roundtables to obtain more information about the noise reducing vortex generator for the A320 family of aircraft prior to formally asking the airlines to install such a device on their existing A320 aircraft. He noted that the vortex generator has been shown to reduce the arrival noise for certain A320 aircraft.

He said that LAWA has reached out to Airbus to find out more about the cost of the vortex generators, their effect on aircraft performance, and whether airlines can install the devices themselves. He noted that while Airbus provided a response to the LAWA's request, it did not contain detailed, pertinent information. Mr. Chan said that Airbus indicated that the cost

of the vortex generator is too sensitive to share and noted the airlines could install the vortex generators themselves.

Mr. Chan indicated he then contacted the O'Hare Noise Compatibility Commission (ONCC) to learn more about its outreach efforts. He noted that ONCC had already written letters to two airlines, American and United, to urge them to install the vortex generators. ONCC and provided him with a recent response letter from United Airlines. He said United Airlines indicated that its approach is to invest in newer, quieter aircraft rather than retrofitting older aircraft like the A320 with vortex generators as those aircraft will be phased out of service. He indicated that after reading United's response, he realized that more research is required prior to approaching the airlines to ensure a higher chance of success with this effort.

Member LaMar asked whether the vortex generators affect performance. Mr. Chan said that LAWA had asked Airbus but did not receive a response to that question. Member Petra Schneider expressed interest in knowing how the installation of the vortex generators is going and suggested that LAWA contact Lufthansa. Mr. Chan said that LAWA has considered contacting Lufthansa and that it could be the next step. Mr. Chan said that finding out the cost of the vortex generator will help to determine whether the airlines will be interested in installing them. Ms. Pantoja said that finding the right person to ask at each airline is challenging.

Mr. Alverson suggested that there are three categories of aircraft to consider: newly manufactured A320s, which already have the vortex generator installed; older A320 aircraft that are being phased out over the next couple of years; and aircraft that will continue in service for a number of years that do not yet have the vortex generator installed. He suggested that it would be best to identify the latter category of aircraft that are operating at LAX and put our energy into pursuing them.

Chairman Schneider suggested that LAWA report back at the next meeting on any further progress that has been made.

## **8. Review/Approve Roundtable Work Program**

Mr. Chan highlighted some of the changes that had been made to the Roundtable Work Program, noting first that the design process for Southern California Metroplex (see Work Program Item A1) is complete and the environmental review should be completed by mid-2015. Chairman Schneider asked if any of the Roundtable's recommendations had been included in the design. Ms. Pantoja noted that FAA has said that the designs will be available for review when the Draft Environmental Assessment is released. Member Lehrman asked how the flight tracks in the EA were evaluated, since aircraft are not flying on them now. Ms. Pantoja responded that the FAA uses modeled flight tracks to conduct their environmental analyses. Member Lehrman noted that FAA's conceptual design work started in November 2011, which is when aircraft were perceived to have started flying lower over Culver City. Vice Chairman Jacobson noted that the FAA has not yet implemented any of the Metroplex changes.

Mr. Chan said that the FAR Part 161 process has been completed (see Work Program Item A2) and LAWA does not plan to pursue the requested restriction further, following the rejection of the request by FAA. Chairman Schneider asked the Roundtable if it wished to take further action on this item such as sending a letter to the FAA asking it to reconsider its decision. Mr. Chan suggested that the Roundtable wait to take further action until after Mr.

Tatro gives a full debrief on the FAA's determination at the March 11, 2015 Roundtable meeting.

Mr. Chan noted that the FAA is conducting a six-month test extending the LOOP departures from 9 pm to midnight (see Work Program Item A6). He said the six-month test is scheduled to end in February 2015. Chairman Schneider requested that LAWA or the FAA provide an update on the test at the March 11, 2015 Roundtable meeting. Member Bedford asked if the FAA changed the flight track associated with the LOOP departure. Mr. Chan said the FAA did not change the flight track.

Mr. Chan noted that the Roundtable Facilitator provided a briefing on the LAX Preferential Runway Use Program (see Work Program Item A9) that indicated compliance with the program is high.

Mr. Chan noted that a new item, A12. Noise Exposure from the Family of A320 Aircraft, had been added to the Work Program. Mr. Chan said that the Roundtable needed to assign a level of priority to this new item, from 1 to 10. After discussion, Chairman Schneider assigned the item a priority of 9 with no objections.

Mr. Chan noted that the Roundtable Facilitator had given a briefing on the fact that there is no longer any mechanism for the Roundtable to provide input to the Airport Cooperative Research Program on the Problem Statements. As a result, Work Program Item C6 - Airport Cooperative Research Program (ACRP) has been closed.

Chairman Schneider asked if the FAA had responded to the Roundtable's letter commenting on the Net Noise Reduction method (see Work program Item C6). Mr. Alverson said that while the FAA will review and address the comments submitted by the Roundtable as a part of the rulemaking process, it is not likely that the Roundtable will receive a direct response. He noted that staff will monitor this issue and report back at a future meeting.

Chairman Schneider called for a motion to approve the 2014-2015 Roundtable Work Program. Member LaMar's motion to approve the 2014-2015 Roundtable Work Program was seconded by member Jacobson and approved unanimously by the Roundtable.

The approved 2014-2015 Roundtable Work Program is available for review on the Roundtable webpage: <http://www.lawa.org/LAXNoiseRoundTable.aspx>.

## **9. Statistical Update on Aircraft Operations**

LAWA staff member David Chan presented updated statistics for Roundtable Work Items A2, A3, and A4. Mr. Chan's presentation is summarized below.

### **Work Program Item A2: East Departures between 12 AM and 6:30 AM during Over-Ocean or West Operations**

Description: Aircraft departing to the east between Midnight and 6:30 a.m., when LAX is not in Easterly Operations, occurs when there are slight to mild easterly wind conditions that prompt heavy aircraft to take off to the east, into the wind, for climb performance and safety. This operation causes noise disturbances to communities especially during nighttime hours.
---

Mr. Chan reviewed the annual east departure statistics indicating that east departures spiked in 2004 due to a Pacific thunderstorm, but since that time the number of east departures at night has trended downward, reaching an all-time low in 2009. He noted that he expects that east departures in 2014 will be very low at approximately 27. Member Petra Schneider asked if LAWA looks at the data for the weather conditions at the time of the east departures. Mr. Chan said he uses LAWA's Aircraft Noise and Operations Management System (ANOMS) to review the flight tracks that pass through a gate indicating an east departure and listens to ATC recordings to note the wind conditions. Mr. Chan indicated that Qantas Airlines had the most east departures for the current one-year period because it operates the most 747 aircraft, which tend to take off to the east due to winds.

### **Work Program Item A3: Early Turn of Aircraft Departing to the West**

Description: Aircraft departing to the west that turn before reaching the shoreline fly over communities to the south and north of LAX causing noise disturbances.

Mr. Chan reviewed the annual trend in early turns to the north, highlighting the fact that they dropped off dramatically after 2005. He explained that the drop-off was due to a switch from turboprops to regional jets. Mr. Chan pointed out that turboprops conduct the majority of early turns on the north runway complex and that the total number of north early turns represents less than one percent of the total departures on the north side.

Mr. Chan then covered the south early turns and explained that the spike between 2006 and 2008 was due to construction activity at LAX. He said that LAWA investigates all early turns that pass through the El Segundo and Playa Del Rey gates. He explained that LAWA listens to the air traffic control communications to determine if the early turn was initiated by the controller or the pilot.

Member Petra Schneider asked why LAWA doesn't investigate the Hyperion gate penetrations. Ms. Pantoja said the Hyperion gate is over a wastewater treatment plant, while the El Segundo and Playa Del Rey gates are over residential areas.

Mr. Chan noted that SkyWest has the most early turns because they perform the most turboprop departures at LAX. However, early turns represent only about one and a half percent of SkyWest's annual departures. He noted that General Aviation aircraft had the second greatest number of early turns.

### **Work Program Item A4: Missed Approaches/Go-Arounds**

Description: At times aircraft arriving at LAX are required to abort their landing and execute a missed approach. Historically, aircraft executing a missed approach have impacted the communities to the north and south of the airport depending on the runway complex they were originally assigned.

Mr. Chan explained that go-arounds were on a declining trend from year to year reaching the lowest level in 2009 with a slight uptick since that time, which corresponds to the uptick in total annual traffic at LAX. Chairman Schneider asked if the reduction in spacing between arriving aircraft contributed to the increased go-arounds. FAA representative Rolan Morel said that spacing has not been reduced between arriving aircraft at LAX. Mr. Morel said the number one reason for go-arounds is that arrival aircraft don't get off of the runways as quickly as desired.

Vice Chairman Jacobson noted that the most go-arounds occur during the summer months. Mr. Morel said that aircraft operations increase in the summer months, so it makes sense that go-arounds peak during the summer. Chairman Schneider asked if there is a specific altitude required for go-arounds. Mr. Morel said that the ATC tower's first task is to warn the SoCal controller that an unexpected aircraft is coming into their airspace. He noted the controller that receives the aircraft must keep it separated from all of the other aircraft in the vicinity of LAX. Member Lehrman asked if the airspace belongs to the Southern California (SoCal) TRACON. Mr. Morel said yes, SoCal TRACON issues the climb. Member Cope indicated she is seeing about one to two go-arounds per day. Mr. Chan said that sound about right based on the statistics.

Mr. Chan reviewed the reasons for go-arounds in July 2014. He noted that pilot initiated go-arounds were dominated by aircraft being too high or too fast. He said that controller initiated go-arounds were predominantly due to in-trail spacing.

He then reviewed the statistics for aircraft not maintaining runway heading during go-arounds indicating that most of these events occur on the south runway complex as more traffic at LAX is on the south side. He also noted that the numbers of these events are very small. He said that SkyWest had the most go-arounds on the south runway complex, while Southwest had the most go-arounds on the north runway complex. He noted this breakdown corresponds to location of each airline's terminals and their number of operations.

The complete statistical update on aircraft operations presentation can be found on the Roundtable webpage at <http://www.lawa.org/LAXNoiseRoundTable.aspx>.

## **10. Aviation Noise News Update**

Mr. Alverson summarized several recent aviation noise news items for the Roundtable including:

- An article regarding the Airborne Spacing for Terminal Arrival Routes (ASTAR) software currently being tested by NASA that will improve flight efficiency and reduce environmental impacts on communities.
- An article about Airbus' plans for new engines and a stretched version of the A380 despite the fact there were no A380 sales in 2014.
- A news report regarding lobbying of Congress by airline and airport industry groups on the next FAA reauthorization bill.
- An article on the car service company Uber expanding its per-seat helicopter ridesharing to new markets including Los Angeles.
- An article on LAX setting a record for passenger volume in 2014.
- An opinion piece on the possible range of effects of low oil prices on the aviation industry.
- An article on how the use of the "climb via" clearance by FAA is only producing a 10 to 20 percent compliance rate.
- An article on how the sale of transport category aircraft boosted the aerospace industry to \$228 billion in sales in 2014.

The complete aviation noise news update presentation can be found on the Roundtable webpage at <http://www.lawa.org/LAXNoiseRoundTable.aspx>.

## **11. Roundtable Member Discussion**

Member Lehrman noted that there are some days in Culver City that are quiet and other days that are not. Ms. Pantoja said days that are louder could be due to weather conditions.

Chairman Schneider noted that residents on the east coast are petitioning the White House for the adoption of the 55 DNL standard. Member Petra Schneider said the petition requires one hundred thousand signatures for it to move forward. Member Rubin asked if the Roundtable should weigh in on this issue. Chairman Schneider said it would not at this point.

Member Rubin said that air quality continues to be a significant concern to him, but understands it is not within the Roundtable's purview.

Chairman Schneider asked if the FAA has any intention of providing funds for deteriorating sound insulation treatments. Mr. Chan explained that Mr. Alverson had given a presentation on an ACRP report that had indicated that the deterioration of sound insulation treatments was predominantly due to poor homeowner upkeep. Mr. Alverson added that FAA has said that funding for sound insulation is a one-time occurrence. Chairman Schneider asked what happens to homes where the original owner opted out and the new owner would like to have their home sound insulated. Ms. Pantoja said that once a program is closed out, there is no option for homeowners to receive sound insulation. She added that a new owner of a residential property that previously opted out may be able to get back in if the program for that area is still active.

## **12. Review of Roundtable Actions and Requests from Members**

Mr. Alverson reviewed the Roundtable's action and request items during the meeting, which included:

### **Formal Action Items**

The Roundtable unanimously approved the membership of the three groups that submitted membership requests, which included the Westchester Neighbors Association, the North Westdale Neighborhood Association, and the Ladera Heights Civic Association.

Due to the conflict between Veteran's Day and the regular Roundtable meeting date in November 2015, the Roundtable agreed without objection to set the date for the November 2015 meeting as Tuesday, November 10, 2015.

The Roundtable unanimously approved the 2014-2015 Work Program, which included assigning a priority of 9 to new item A12 - Noise Exposure From A320 Family of Aircraft.

### **Requests from Members**

Chairman Schneider requested a review of the section of the Bylaws regarding membership requirements be added to the next meeting agenda.

Chairman Schneider requested that LAWA provide an update on its progress regarding the A320 vortex generator at the March 11, 2015 meeting.

Mr. Chan said that LAWA plans provide a full review of FAA's Part 161 determination at the March 11, 2015 meeting.



Chairman Schneider requested a status report on the Loop Departure Test at the March 11, 2015 meeting.

### **13. Adjournment**

Mr. Alverson noted that the next LAX Roundtable meeting is scheduled for 7:00 PM on Wednesday, March 11, 2015. Chairman Schneider adjourned the meeting at 9:03 pm.