LAX/COMMUNITY NOISE ROUNDTABLE

Recap of the Regular Meeting of November 12, 2014

Roundtable Members Present

Denny Schneider, Chairman, Westchester Neighbors Association
Blake LaMar, City of Palos Verdes Estates
Petra Schneider, City of Rancho Palos Verdes
Danna Cope, LAX Area Advisory Committee
Yvonne Bedford, Ladera Heights Civic Association
JoAnn Williams, United Homeowners Association
John Bailey, Southeast Torrance Homeowners’ Association
Martin Rubin, North Westdale Neighborhood Association
June Lehrman, City of Culver City
Glen Martin and Rolan Morel, Federal Aviation Administration
Scott Tatro, LAWA

LAWA, Airlines, and Consultant Staff

David Chan, LAWA
Dan Delane, Federal Express
Steve Alverson, Roundtable Facilitator

Guest Speakers

James Castañeda, SFO Roundtable Coordinator
Cindy Gibbs, BridgeNet International

A quorum of the members was present.

1. Welcome/Review of the Meeting Format

Roundtable Facilitator Steve Alverson welcomed everyone to the meeting and reviewed the meeting format. He said that the Roundtable meetings are facilitated in order to stay on topic and on schedule. He noted that the agenda includes a period for public comment and the Chair may entertain questions from the audience as time permits.
2. Call to Order

Roundtable Chairman Denny Schneider called the meeting to order at 7:01 pm PST in the Samuel Greenberg Boardroom at LAX.

3. Comments from the Public

A resident of El Segundo shared her concerns about numerous overflights of El Segundo by aircraft departing on the outboard runway since July, especially between the hours of 11 pm and 3 am. LAWA staff member David Chan stated that there have been closures of the inboard runway for maintenance at night, which has periodically required the use of the outboard runway, Runway 25L, for departures. He added that the outboard runway is the least preferred with respect to noise, which he will address in detail during his statistical update later in the meeting. He also noted that last week the inboard runway, Runway 25R, was closed Monday through Friday.

4. Welcome New Representative

LAWA staff member David Chan reported that he had received a letter from the City of Monterey Park confirming the change in the City’s representation at the Roundtable. He indicated that the letter identified Mr. Chris Arriola as the new representative and Mr. Cesar Vega as the new alternate. Mr. Chan welcomed Mr. Arriola and Mr. Vega to the Roundtable and provided them with Roundtable membership binders. He notified the new representatives that they will begin receiving the Airport Noise Report and invited Member Arriola to say a few words.

Mr. Arriola mentioned that he was born in and grew up in Monterey Park. He noted that the City has concerns about aircraft noise and is interested in finding solutions.

Note: This item occurred after Item 5 to accommodate Member Arriola’s schedule.

5. Work Program Item C1: Update on SFO Roundtable

San Francisco International Airport (SFO) Community Noise Roundtable Coordinator, James Castañeda, noted that the SFO Roundtable had requested that he and Ms. Gibbs travel to Los Angeles and observe an LAX Roundtable meeting. He explained that as a part of the visit, LAWA asked them to provide the LAX Roundtable with an update on the SFO Roundtable’s activities.

After providing a brief review of the composition and history of the 33-year old SFO Roundtable, Mr. Castañeda described some of the current departure and arrival noise issues that the SFO Roundtable has been involved with. He said that with respect to departures, the SFO Roundtable has been working with the City of Brisbane related to aircraft flying to Southern California on the PORTE departure route. He said that with respect to arrival noise issues, the Roundtable has been working with the residents of Woodside and Portola Valley, which are impacted by noise from aircraft arriving over the Woodside VOR. He explained that the primary source of concern results from oceanic arrivals and vectored flights over rural areas where the ambient sound level is low. He noted that the SFO Roundtable works closely with the FAA to address aircraft noise issues in the San Francisco Bay Area.
Ms. Gibbs provided a briefing on the Northern California Metroplex process. She explained that the Environmental Assessment (EA) for the Metroplex process used 65 CNEL as the threshold for noise impact. She said the FAA concluded that none of the proposed changes in flight procedures resulted in an increase in number of people exposed to 65 CNEL. As a result, the Metroplex EA received a Finding of No Significant Impact (FONSI) in the FAA’s Record of Decision (ROD).

Ms. Gibbs said the SFO Roundtable submitted two comments on the Northern California Metroplex EA concerning early departure turns and a lack of defined flight tracks for the arrival procedures. She added that the procedures defined in the Metroplex process will be implemented beginning on November 14, 2014. She noted that of the 35 new procedures, 12 are associated with SFO. Ms. Gibbs said that several residents in the vicinity of the Woodside VOR had filed suit against the FAA on the Metroplex EA.

Mr. Castañeda closed the presentation by noting that like the LAX Roundtable, the SFO Roundtable utilizes a work program to guide its efforts and has a website for the public and members to access meeting agendas and other related materials.

Chairman Schneider asked how many members were on the SFO Roundtable. Mr. Castañeda said that the Roundtable is composed of 19 member cities and two counties. He added that the FAA is an active participant.

Member Rubin asked whether the SFO Roundtable members were interested in air pollution and whether air pollution related to ground operations had been discussed. Mr. Castañeda said that while the topic of air pollution comes up from time to time, it is not a part of the SFO Roundtable’s charge. Mr. Castañeda indicated that the gates at SFO are electrified, so aircraft turn off their auxiliary power units shortly after arriving at the gate.

FAA representative Glen Martin noted that seven of the 12 procedures in the Metroplex EA were implemented today and that more will be implemented in the next 56-day cycle for the release of chart revisions. Ms. Gibbs noted that the SFO Roundtable members are interested in comparing the before and after flight tracks.

LAWA representative Scott Tatro asked if the arrivals over the Woodside VOR were related to the Oceanic Arrivals, which fly an Optimized Profile Descent (OPD). Ms. Gibbs said that OPDs are used by a very small percentage of the flights and a study last year did not show much change in noise level. She also noted that pilots must specifically request OPD in order to fly that particular procedure.

Chairman Schneider asked how many aircraft noise complaints were received per year by SFO. Ms. Gibbs said the number was about 15,000. She added that complaints help identify any hotspots that may require the airport or Roundtable’s attention.

Member Cope asked whether there was any thought by the SFO Roundtable of adding community groups to the SFO Roundtable membership. Mr. Castañeda said that community groups work through their elected officials on the SFO Roundtable. He also noted that the Roundtable meetings are open to the public, so some community groups attend the SFO Roundtable meetings. Chairman Schneider asked if the SFO Roundtable receives support from local congressional representatives. Ms. Gibbs said that although they are not members on the SFO Roundtable, several congressional representatives have provided support. Chairman Schneider asked whether the SFO Roundtable makes land use
recommendations. Mr. Castañeda said no, the Airport Land Use Commission handles land use issues.

The presentation regarding the SFO Community Noise Roundtable can be found on the LAX Roundtable webpage at http://www.lawa.org/LAXNoiseRoundTable.aspx.

6. Discussion/Recommendation on A320 Series Aircraft

Member Petra Schneider gave a presentation on a potential noise issue related to the A320 family of aircraft as well as a potential solution known as a vortex generator. Member Schneider noted that air flowing across open cavities on the wing of the A320 aircraft creates a pure tonal noise. She noted that the vortex generator is a small metal device that is placed in front (on the leading edge) of the cavity, which changes the air flow over the cavity and reduces the noise by 2 to 6 dB. She added that the noise occurs several miles from the runway end.

She stated that Airbus is already placing vortex generators on newly manufactured aircraft and Lufthansa and Air France are retrofitting their aircraft that operate in Europe. She reviewed the statistics for A320 aircraft arrivals at LAX noting that in 2014 they comprised approximately 17 percent of the total arrivals. She added that four airlines, Virgin America, United Airlines, US Airways, and American Airlines, account for 80 percent of the A320 operations at LAX.

Member Schneider recommended that LAWA reach out to the four airlines to inquire about what their plans are with respect to the installation of the vortex generators. She also suggested that LAWA reach out to other Roundtables to provide a unified front on this issue. She further recommended that the Roundtable stay abreast of international news sources and track European noise alliances to see whether there are other best practices that could be implemented at LAX.

Member Baily suggested that the Roundtable invite Airbus to give a presentation on this topic. Scott Tatro said that LAWA would take on the responsibility of reaching out to the four airlines, Airbus and other Roundtables on this issue.

The presentation regarding noise from the A320 series aircraft can be found on the LAX Roundtable webpage at http://www.lawa.org/LAXNoiseRoundTable.aspx.

7. Aircraft Noise 101

LAWA Roundtable Facilitator Steve Alverson gave an “Aircraft Noise 101” presentation to the Roundtable covering the following general topic areas:

- Roles and Responsibilities for Aircraft Noise
- Relevant Federal Regulations
- Relevant California Regulations
- Aircraft Noise Metrics
- Noise “Rules of Thumb”

The purpose of the presentation was to introduce new Roundtable members to key regulations and noise descriptors that are used regularly in addressing aircraft noise issues. The presentation also served as a refresher for long-term Roundtable members and provided updates on some recently revised guidance documents.
LAWA staff member David Chan presented a series of slides related to Roundtable Work Items A9 and A10. Mr. Chan’s presentation is summarized below.

**Work Program Item A9: Departures on Runway 25L**

**Description: Aircraft departing from Runway 25L create noise disturbances to the communities south of LAX, especially during nighttime hours.**

Mr. Chan reviewed the annual departure statistics for the inboard runway (Runway 25R) and the outboard runway (Runway 25L) noting that a slight increase in the percentage of Runway 25L departures had occurred in 2013 due to the increased closure activity on Runway 25R. He also noted that when the inboard runway is closed for maintenance, departures on the outboard runway increase. He provided a breakdown of the cargo versus passenger aircraft departures for the past 13 months, indicating that the majority of aircraft use Runway 25R for departure.

Mr. Chan reviewed a graph depicting the Runway 25L departures from midnight to 6:30 am for the month of September 2014. He noted that the graph demonstrates that when Runway 25R is closed, departures on Runway 25L increase. He presented a similar graph for the period from 6:30 am to midnight, which illustrated there are fewer runway closures during the day. However, he noted that on September 6, 2014, Runway 25R was closed for almost the entire day, resulting in the increase use of Runway 25L for departures.

Mr. Chan explained that design group VI aircraft such as the A380 and the B747-8 are not able to depart on Runway 25R due to insufficient spacing between the runway and Taxiway B. So these aircraft would need to either depart on 25L on the south complex or 24L on the north complex.

He added that it is difficult for general aviation and air cargo aircraft to depart on Runway 25R as they would need to cross two active runways since their facilities are located on the south side. He said despite this challenge, the FAA has managed to assign more general aviation and air cargo departures on Runway 25R than on Runway 25L.

Mr. Chan said that FedEx has the most operations among the cargo carriers at LAX. He added that over the past 19 months FedEx has gradually decreased departures on Runway 25L because the carrier agreed to request Runway 25R for departures when safety and air traffic volumes permit.

**Work Program Item A10: Turboprop Community Overflights**

**Description: Turboprop aircraft departing to the west/southwest with destinations to the east overfly the Palos Verdes Peninsula and Torrance en route to the Seal Beach VOR.**

Mr. Chan said that the annual number of southbound turboprops has been steadily declining as has the number of overflights of the Palos Verdes (PV) Peninsula. He noted that
turboprop overflights of the PV Peninsula have dropped from an average of 53 per day in 2000 to 10 per day in 2013. He said that most of the turboprop aircraft are between 7,000 to 9,000 feet above mean sea level over the PV Peninsula. He noted that during the past 12 months, SkyWest had the most southbound departures at approximately 8,500 with approximately 2,500 overflying the PV Peninsula.

Mr. Chan reviewed the annual statistics for jet overflights of the PV Peninsula noting that historically only two to three percent of the southbound jets overflew the Peninsula with that number dropping to one percent in 2013. He noted that of majority of the jets that overfly the Peninsula are at altitudes above 13,000 feet mean sea level. He attributed the small percentage of overflights of the PV Peninsula to improved air traffic controller education.

The complete presentation on the statistical update on aircraft operations can be found on the Roundtable webpage at http://www.lawa.org/LAXNoiseRoundTable.aspx.

9. Aviation Noise News Update

Mr. Alverson reviewed several recent aviation noise news items for the Roundtable including:

- A letter from 24 members of Congress urging the FAA to revise the national noise policy by lowering the 65 dB DNL compatibility threshold to 55 dB DNL.
- A letter from 13 members of Congress announcing the formation of the Quiet Skies Caucus which is focused on urging the FAA to update the nearly 40 year old aviation noise policy.
- Two articles documenting comments to the FAA on the Net Noise Reduction Method for implementing the CatEx2 provision of the 2012 FAA reauthorization legislation.
- An article regarding the FAA and aviation industry partners’ announcement of a plan to deliver NextGen benefits in the coming years.
- An article regarding the NextGen Advisory Committee’s blueprint for success in implementing Performance Based Navigation procedures.
- An announcement by the FAA regarding the creation of a stakeholder collaboration program for recognizing and rewarding collaboration, stewardship, leadership, progress, and innovation in the environment and energy arenas.
- A news story about Delta Airlines replacing its 747 aircraft with A350 aircraft, which reflects a shifting of its capacity from trans-Atlantic to trans-Pacific routes.
- A news story regarding Air China receiving its first GEnx-2B-Powered B747-8 aircraft, which is the quietest engine GE produces based on the ratio of decibels to pounds of thrust.
- A news story about United Airlines launching a route between LAX and Melbourne, Australia with the new Boeing 787-9 Dreamliner; the longest Dreamliner route in the world.
- An article regarding the FAA’s efforts to establish comprehensive complaint system for helicopter noise in L.A. County.

With respect to the article regarding the helicopter noise complaint system, FAA representative Glen Martin said that the FAA is not purchasing a WebTrak system. Member Rubin asked how much notice would be given to residents prior to the helicopter complaint system becoming operational. Mr. Martin said that a request for a quote had been issued and it will take some time to design the system with the selected vendor. Member Petra
Schneider expressed concern that there may be too many noise complaint systems and the public will not know which one to use. She suggested that it would be better to have a single noise complaint system. Mr. Martin explained that most fixed-wing aircraft operations are associated with an airport, so it is easier for residents to file a complaint with a specific airport complaint system. He noted that helicopters can originate from a number of different locations, so a separate complaint system dedicated to noise from helicopter operations is appropriate.

The complete aviation noise news update can be found on the Roundtable webpage at http://www.lawa.org/LAXNoiseRoundTable.aspx.

10. Roundtable Member Discussion

LAWA representative Scott Tatro noted that LAWA had submitted an FAR Part 161 application to the FAA for a nighttime restriction on east departures during west-flow and over-ocean operations. He said that on November 7, 2014, the FAA issued a letter denying LAWA’s request. He explained that under the FAR Part 161 process, the FAA must determine if the proposed restriction meets all six statutory criteria identified in the regulation. Mr. Tatro said that the FAA concluded that LAWA’s application met only three of the six criteria. Therefore, the FAA denied LAWA’s Part 161 application.

Member Lehrman asked what LAWA plans to do next with respect to the proposed restriction. Mr. Tatro stated that LAWA has no plans to pursue the restriction any further. He noted that FAR Part 161 sets a very high bar and LAWA spent ten years putting together the best possible application. He said that LAWA accepts the FAA’s decision.

Member Williams asked if LAWA planned to give a more detailed presentation on the FAA’s determination. Mr. Tatro said that LAWA would provide a more detailed presentation at a future meeting, but that he would not be able to attend the January 2015 Roundtable meeting. He noted that the FAA’s determination letter has been posted on LAWA’s Part 161 Study website (http://www.lawa.org/LAXPart161.aspx?id=7203).

Mr. Chan noted that the two-year Roundtable membership term for At-Large members is expiring in January 2015. He asked community group members to submit a letter requesting membership renewal for the Roundtable to consider at the January 2015 Roundtable meeting.

Mr. Chan pointed out that the meeting scheduled for November 11, 2015 falls on Veterans Day. He suggested that the Roundtable meet on the day before the holiday, which is Tuesday, November 10, 2015. Chairman Schneider asked Mr. Chan to include this item on the agenda for the next meeting so that the members can decide and vote.

Member Petra Schneider said she has received complaints from Rancho Palos Verdes residents regarding ultralights. She asked who could address them. Mr. Martin suggested that the ultralight complaints be forwarded to him.

Member Petra Schneider asked if the Roundtable has used subcommittees. Chairman Denny Schneider said that the Roundtable had tried using subcommittees in the past, but it did not work. He noted all of the members wanted to be involved in the discussion.
11. Review of Roundtable Actions and Requests from Members

Mr. Alverson reviewed the Roundtable’s action and request items during the meeting, which included:

**Formal Action Items**

None.

**Requests from Members**

Member Petra Schneider made recommendations to the Roundtable regarding the high-pitched whining noise associated with the A320 family of aircraft. She suggested reaching out to key airlines and Airbus to share her findings about the A320 noise problem and the installation of a vortex generator that can solve this noise issue. She also suggested reaching out to other airport noise roundtables/forums regarding a coordinated effort on promoting the A320 vortex generator installation by airline operators. LAWA representative Scott Tatro indicated that LAWA will take on the responsibility of contacting the airlines, Airbus, and other airport noise roundtables to carry out the recommendations.

LAWA representative Scott Tatro agreed to provide the Roundtable with a full briefing on the FAA’s disapproval of the LAX Part 161 application at a future meeting.

Mr. Chan noted that the two-year membership term for At-Large members is expiring in January 2015. He asked community group members to submit a letter requesting membership renewal for the Roundtable to consider at the January 2015 Roundtable meeting.

Mr. Chan pointed out that the meeting scheduled for November 11, 2015 falls on Veterans Day. He suggested that the Roundtable meet on the day before the holiday, which is Tuesday, November 10, 2015. Chairman Schneider asked Mr. Chan to include this item on the agenda for the next meeting so that the members can decide and vote.

12. Adjournment

Mr. Chan noted that the next LAX Roundtable meeting is scheduled for Wednesday, January 14, 2015. Chairman Schneider wished everyone happy holidays and adjourned the meeting at 9:16 pm.