LAX/COMMUNITY NOISE ROUNDTABLE

Recap of the Regular Meeting of July 11, 2012

Roundtable Members Present

Denny Schneider, Chairman, Westchester Neighbors Association
Carl Jacobson, Vice Chairman, City of El Segundo
Blake LaMar, City of Palos Verdes Estates
Matt Waters, Staff, City of Rancho Palos Verdes
Chad Molnar, City of Los Angeles - CD 11
Danna Cope, LAX Area Advisory Committee
Yvonne Bedford, Ladera Heights Civic Association
John Bailey, Southeast Torrance Homeowners’ Association
JoAnn Williams, United Homeowners Association
Steve May and Rolan Morel, Federal Aviation Administration
Michael Feldman, LAWA

LAWA, Airlines, and Consultant Staff

Kathryn Pantoja, LAWA
Scott Tatro, LAWA
Bob Holden, LAWA
David Chan, LAWA
John Manley, SkyWest Airlines
Steve Alverson, Roundtable Facilitator

A quorum of the members was present.

1. Welcome/Review of the Meeting Format

   Roundtable Facilitator Steve Alverson welcomed everyone to the meeting and reviewed the meeting format.

2. Call to order

   Roundtable Chairman Denny Schneider called the meeting to order at 7:04 pm PDT in the Samuel Greenberg Boardroom at LAX.

3. Comments from the Public
Richard Root, a Torrance resident and member of the Torrance Helicopter Committee, informed the Roundtable that the Torrance Helicopter Committee had met with the FAA which had agreed to conduct a six-month test of revised helicopter arrival and departure routes. He also informed the Roundtable of an upcoming helicopter noise meeting arranged by Congressman Howard Berman that is tentatively scheduled for August 6th or August 8th. The meeting location and time have not yet been established, although it is likely to be held in the Valley near Van Nuys Airport. He concluded his comments by thanking the Roundtable for doing an outstanding job. There were no other people wishing make public comment, so Chairman Schneider closed the public comment period.

4. Election of Roundtable Officers for Two-Year Terms

Chairman Schneider asked Member Danna Cope to serve as Nomination Chair during the officer elections. Member Cope led the Roundtable members through the Roundtable Officers Election Process. Member Cope noted that there was only one candidate for each of the two open seats. She explained that she would entertain motions for nominations from the floor. She provided three opportunities for nominations for each position. There were no additional nominations. At the Nomination Chair’s request, Member Blake LaMar made a motion to re-elect Chairman Schneider and Vice Chairman Jacobson by acclamation. The motion was seconded by member Yvonne Bedford and carried unanimously.

5. Work Program Item C6 – Review/Suggest ACRP FY2013 Problem Statements for Research Consideration

Roundtable Facilitator Steve Alverson reviewed five Problem Statements related to noise research that were submitted to the Airport Cooperative Research Program (ACRP) for consideration for inclusion in the Fiscal Year 2013 research projects. Steve indicated that the ACRP Review Panel selected only one of the five for funding. However, Steve felt as though two of the five deserved funding including the one recommended by ACRP.

Steve reviewed all five proposals. Two were related to sound insulation program guidance, one was related to associating human annoyance to repetitive low-noise level overflights, another examined the development of a multimodal noise model, and the last sought to provide guidance on helicopter noise modeling. Steve recommended that the Roundtable forward a letter to the ACRP Oversight Committee supporting the multimodal noise model and the helicopter noise modeling guidance problem statements for research consideration.

LAWA staff member Scott Tatro indicated that he served as a member of ACRP’s Problem Statement Review Panel, so he was intimately familiar with each of the Problem Statements. While he supported the development of helicopter noise modeling guidance, he did not support the development of the multimodal noise modeling tool because it seems better suited to an agency like the FAA that could maintain it. Scott explained that ACRP does not have the ability to support models once they are developed.

LAWA Member Michael Feldman asked Steve Alverson to briefly explain the content of FAA’s anticipated Program Guidance Letter (PGL) on sound insulation programs. Steve explained that the FAA is expected to require that the interior noise levels of homes exceed 45 DNL (CNEL in California) in order to be eligible for sound insulation. If adopted by FAA, this requirement could reduce the number of eligible homes for FAA-funded sound insulation programs across the country. Scott Tatro added that FAA is proposing to take this approach to save money. He also said that LAW, through its participation in the Airport Council
International (ACI), is working to positively influence the contents of the PGL before it is published by FAA.

After a brief discussion of the problem statements, Vice Chairman Carl Jacobson moved that the Roundtable direct the Chair to develop a letter supporting the two Problem Statements as recommended by Steve Alverson. The motion was seconded by Member Blake LaMar and carried unanimously. Chairman Schneider signed the letter at the meeting for LAWA to forward to the ACRP Oversight Committee.

The complete presentation on the suggested ACRP problem statements can be found on the Roundtable webpage at http://www.lawa.org/LAXNoiseRoundTable.aspx.

6. Windsor Hills Noise Investigation

LAWA staff member David Chan reviewed the Windsor Hills noise investigation that LAWA conducted at the request of Member JoAnn Williams who represents the United Homeowners Association, which includes the area of Windsor Hills. Member Williams had provided LAWA with a list of specific dates and times of aircraft noise events that the Windsor Hills community found disturbing. This information allowed LAWA to identify the aircraft operations that were most likely to have caused the disturbances. LAWA’s analysis revealed that slightly more than half (52%) of the noise concerns were caused by north arrivals with aircraft at 4,000 to 8,000 feet above mean sea level (MSL) just north of Windsor Hills. Aircraft on the Loop Departure, which are at an altitude of approximately 13,000 to 17,000 feet MSL, accounted for 20 percent of the Windsor Hills noise concerns. While aircraft on the Over Ocean approach during the hours of midnight to 6:30 am, which fly directly over Windsor Hills at approximately 8,000 – 9,000 feet MSL, accounted for eight percent of the noise concerns. The remaining noise incidents were small percentages of east departures, helicopters, general aviation aircraft, and short turns. David Chan observed that Windsor Hills’ noise concerns were caused by a broad range of LAX operations.

Member Cope asked if noise measurements were made at the homes in Windsor Hills. David Chan explained that there are no noise monitoring terminals in Windsor Hills, so LAWA used flight track data to identify the operations of concern in Windsor Hills. Member Williams asked if there was anything that could be done to address Windsor Hills’ noise concerns. David Chan explained that none of the flight procedures identified in the investigation had changed. However, operations at LAX have been increasing, which could explain why residents are noticing more overflights.

Member Williams thanked LAWA for a prompt and thorough study, but said it doesn’t solve the problem. She said that aircraft noise occurs all hours of the day even in the early morning hours and suggested that noise monitoring might be appropriate. Chairman Schneider said that he did not believe that noise monitoring would answer any questions. It would just reaffirm what LAWA has already learned. She concluded by saying that LAWA’s study did not provide her any comfort and did not resolve the issue.

Member Feldman suggested that aircraft noise may be more noticeable because operations at LAX have been increasing since reaching the lowest level of about 545,000 annual operations in 2009. He continued that 2011 annual operations at LAX were approximately 604,000. He concluded that the issue for Windsor Hills could be as basic as increased aircraft operations. Roundtable Facilitator Steve Alverson said that he has observed similar
concerns from residents near other airports including SFO expressing similar concerns as aircraft operations continue to rise.

Chairman Schneider said that the Roundtable had done what it could on this issue and suggested that the issue be worked offline now. Member Williams asked why Windsor Hills was left out of the sound insulation program. Chairman Schneider explained that while Windsor Hills’ residents may be affected, they are not impacted according to federal regulations. Scott Tatro added that Windsor Hills is well outside the 65 CNEL standard to be eligible for sound insulation.

The complete presentation on the Windsor Hills noise investigation can be found on the Roundtable webpage at http://www.lawa.org/LAXNoiseRoundTable.aspx.

7. Statistical Update on Aircraft Operations

LAWA staff member David Chan started off the statistical update by reviewing the overall trend of the total aircraft operations at LAX as the trend in total operations tends to correspond to changes in specific operations. David explained that overall operations at LAX reached a peak in 2000 prior to the events of 9/11. After 9/11, operations dropped dramatically in 2003 then briefly leveled off before falling to a record low in 2009. After 2009, operations have been trending upward slightly.

Chairman Schneider said that there appeared to be a discrepancy between the aircraft operations numbers in the statistical update and another report that LAWA has released. David Chan and Scott Tatro said that they would need to review the report Chairman Schneider was referring to see why there were differences.

The following summarizes the key points of the statistical update presentation.

**Work Program Item A2: East Departures between 12 AM and 6:30 AM during Over-Ocean or West Operations**

**Description:** Aircraft departing to the east between Midnight and 6:30 a.m., when LAX is not in Easterly Operations, occurs when there are slight to mild easterly wind conditions that prompt heavy aircraft to take off to the east, into the wind, for climb performance and safety. This operation causes noise disturbances to communities especially during nighttime hours.

David reviewed the east departure statistics, which have shown a generally decreasing trend. During the past 12-month period, Qantas led all aircraft operators in east departures. David explained that Qantas operated the most B747 aircraft among the carriers at LAX, so it is not surprising to see that Qantas has the most east departures.

**Work Program Item A3: Early Turn of Aircraft Departing to the West**

**Description:** Aircraft departing to the west that turn before reaching the shoreline fly over communities to the south and north of LAX causing noise disturbances.

David said that the early turns to the north peaked in 2005, then reached a low in 2009, and have been trending upward slightly since then. The trend reflects the change from turboprop...
aircraft to regional jets. David said that the current trend now shows turboprop operations are increasing. Turboprops dominate the early turns to the north.

David then explained that early turns to the south peaked in 2007 due to airfield construction and reached a low in 2010, but have been increasing since that time. David observed that although jets have accounted for the larger share of south early turns since 2007, turboprops have drawn even with jets in 2011 as the overall turboprop traffic has increased at LAX.

Member Molnar suggested showing the early turn statistics as a percentage of total operations so the Roundtable could assess whether the early turns are getting worse or staying about the same. Scott Tatro said that LAWA used to report early turns as percentage, but the Roundtable had requested the absolute numbers.

David continued stating that SkyWest accounted for the majority of south early turns as it also has the highest number of departures compared to other air carriers. David explained that of the 45 early turns that LAWA investigated in May 2012, 27 were at the direction of FAA and 18 were pilot initiated.

David said since an airline representative is participating at tonight’s meeting, he would like to engage him in a discussion to learn more about early turn operations from the pilot’s perspective and to explore the possibility of reducing these operations.

David said LAWA noticed that when ATC directs the pilot to turn left at the LAX VOR, a lot of time the pilot turns before reaching the VOR. He wanted to find out how the pilot determines where the VOR is located. Mr. Manley said that the VOR is not in SkyWest’s flight management system (FMS) and that pilots execute a turn on an assumed location. Member LaMar asked if the VOR could be inserted into the FMS. Mr. Manley said he would check. Mr. Manley added that without a concerted effort to fly straight, turboprops have a natural tendency to veer left.

David Chan asked how the pilots determine when their aircraft has reached the shoreline. Mr. Manley said by looking out the window on a visual flight rules day. FAA Air Traffic Control Tower representative Rolan Morel said that the majority of big turns are a result of needing to add separation between aircraft as well as unannounced go-arounds.

David Chan then asked FAA representative Rolan Morel to look into the possibility of having controllers not reference the LAX VOR when issuing turning instruction as it most likely causes aircraft to turn early and fly over the community. David suggested that controllers should reference the shoreline or the SMO VOR radial. Rolan said he would look into that possibility.

David asked Mr. Manley why a pilot would initiate an early turn even though ATC did not issue an instruction to turn. Mr. Manley said pilots would request an early turn if there were concerns about wake turbulence.

David mentioned that LAWA has increased its efforts on the Early Turn Notification Program. In the past, LAWA was sending the notification to aircraft operators on a monthly basis, but now LAWA is sending it to the airlines on a biweekly basis and GA operators on a weekly basis. These notifications are sent directly to the chief pilots via emails. Mr. Manley
said that at SkyWest, the Chief Pilot contacts the crews to discuss the circumstances of the early turns.

Chairman Schneider said that the Roundtable would appreciate any help the airlines could provide to safely reduce early turns.

**Work Program Item A4: Missed Approaches/Go-Arounds**

| Description: At times aircraft arriving at LAX are required to abort their landing and execute a missed approach. Historically, aircraft executing a missed approach have impacted the communities to the north and south of the airport depending on the runway complex they were originally assigned. |

David Chan explained that after reaching a low of 483 in 2009, go-arounds have trended upward reaching 660 in 2011. David believes there is a direct correlation between the overall increase in LAX operations over the past couple of years and the increase in go-arounds during that same time period. Southwest Airlines had the highest number of go-arounds during the past 12 months with most occurring on the north side of the airfield where they are based. Skywest was a close second with most occurring on the south side of the airfield where they are based.

David asked Mr. Manley if there was anything the he could do to reduce the number of go-arounds. Mr. Manley responded “No.” Rolan Morel said that the go-arounds over El Segundo were for aircraft separation.

Member Cope asked how LAX compares to other airports. Mr. Morel said that he believes LAX’s go-arounds would be lower. Mr. Morel said that LAX operates with a reduced separation of 2.5 miles versus 3 miles. Chairman Schneider added that there were reduced separation standards for the A380 and B747. Mr. Morel said that only the A380 separation standard had been lowered.

The complete presentation on the statistical update on aircraft operations can be found on the Roundtable webpage at [http://www.lawa.org/LAXNoiseRoundTable.aspx](http://www.lawa.org/LAXNoiseRoundTable.aspx).

**8. Review of Roundtable Correspondence Log**

David Chan reviewed the updated Roundtable Correspondence Log to determine if the Roundtable needs to take follow-up actions on some of the letters that are still outstanding. He provided status updates on the following letters:

- **January 23, 2012** correspondence to the House and Aviation Committees on Aviation Matters supporting the Los Angeles Helicopter Relief Act of 2011. This bill is still in committees.

- **July 28, 2011** correspondence to Janice Hahn and the Senate Conferees reaffirming support for the FAA reauthorization bill to include airspace redesign funding and Stage 2 aircraft prohibition. Bill passed in February 2012. It includes Stage 2 aircraft prohibition and funding for Optimization of Airspace and Procedures in the Metroplex project.

- **May 25, 2011** correspondence to Curt Pringle, Chairman of the California High-Speed Rail Authority conveying the Roundtable’s support for a high-speed rail route
to Palmdale. In January 2012, the Authority decided to retain the Palmdale route as a part of the High-speed Rail Project.

- March 25, 2011 correspondence to Thomas Petri, Chairman of the House Subcommittee on Aviation expressing the Roundtable’s opposition to language in the FAA reauthorization bill providing categorical exclusions for Required Navigation Performance (RNP) procedures. The Categorical Exclusion provision is included in the final FAA Reauthorization legislation.

- Two separate letters to ACRP: one suggesting that airspace redesign be ACRP’s FY2013 research focus area and one recommending specific noise problems for consideration in ACRP’s 2012 research program. ACRP chose Information Technology and Airport Maintenance and Operations as the FY 2013 Focus Areas and did not select any noise problem statements for its FY 2012 research program.

The Roundtable received the update and took no further action on any of the letters.

8. Aviation Noise News Update

Steve Alverson reviewed several recent aviation noise news items for the Roundtable including:

- the flight testing of two new aircraft engines, the GE Genx-2B and the P&W PW2100G, that are expected to reduce air emissions and aircraft noise;

- the imminent publication of FAA’s sound insulation PGL was delaying the release of an ACRP guidance document on sound insulation programs;

- the initiation of Alaska Airlines arrivals into Seattle-Tacoma International Airport using satellite guidance to reduce noise, fuel burn, and air emissions;

- a flight training incentive program at Santa Monica Airport that would have sent training flights to other airports was tabled;

- PARTNER had released reports on the design for U.S. field studies on the effects of aircraft noise on sleep and the assessment of window on noise intrusion/energy efficiency/indoor air quality;

- the addition of Class D airspace north and south of LAX; and

- an upcoming community meeting on helicopter noise issues will be held near Van Nuys Airport in early August.

The complete aviation noise news update can be found on the Roundtable webpage at http://www.lawa.org/LAXNoiseRoundTable.aspx.

14. Roundtable Member Discussion

David Chan provided a report back on the Roundtable’s request to look into a possible study that examines sound insulation treatments that were completed in the 1980s to evaluate if they were beginning to degrade. FAA representative Steve May had tracked down
information about the study and provided it to LAWA. David Chan said that ACRP is currently conducting the study, which should be completed in October 2012. David also said that current FAA policy does not allow the FAA to fund the retreatment of homes. Once the sound insulation materials are installed, the homeowners are responsible for maintaining them.

Chairman Schneider requested that the issue of the Roundtable recommending to FAA that it support funding the retreatment of homes with outdated acoustic materials be placed on the next Roundtable meeting agenda.

Steve May provided an update on the Southern California Optimization of Airspace and Procedures in the Metroplex (OAPM) process. Steve said that the purpose of the OAPM process is to transition from procedures based on ground-based navigational aids to satellite-based procedures. Steve May said that there are three phases to the Southern California OAPM process: the study phase; the design phase; and the implementation phase. Steve said that the study phase is complete and the design phase will kick off on October 15th. The design phase should take approximately six months. The implementation phase will include the environmental process and should take about 18 months. The environmental process will provide an opportunity for public comment.

Steve May said that FAA is aware of the San Gabriel Mountain Recreation Area that is currently under consideration by the National Parks Service and it will be considered as appropriate in the environmental documentation process.

Chairman Schneider asked when the Roundtable will have the opportunity to provide input into the OAPM process. Steve May said that the implementation phase is the appropriate phase for providing input on environmental issues.

Member Cope expressed concern that it seems late in the process. Steve May said the OAPM is primarily focused on taking the existing procedures and converting them to satellite-based procedures. He added that he is aware of the Roundtable’s concerns, but the Roundtable should feel free to provide input to him and he will bring it into the OPAM process. Scott Tatro said that OAPM is on a very aggressive schedule, so changes that might trigger an EIS would be tabled for consideration under a different process. LAWA understands that at a minimum FAA will prepare an EA.

Chairman Schneider requested that a discussion of the Roundtable’s recommendations for FAA consideration in the OAPM process be placed on the next Roundtable meeting agenda.

15. Review of Roundtable Actions and Requests from Members

Steve Alverson reviewed the actions taken during the meeting, which included:

The Roundtable unanimously re-elected Denny Schneider and Carl Jacobson for two-year terms as Chair and Vice Chair, respectively.

The members approved Steve Alverson’s suggestion for the Roundtable to send a letter to the ACRP Oversight Committee to express support for the following two problem statements for research:

Steve Alverson reviewed the requests from members during the meeting, which included:

Chairman Schneider requested that the issue of the Roundtable recommending to FAA that it support funding the retreatment of homes with outdated acoustic materials be placed on the next Roundtable meeting agenda.

Chairman Schneider requested that a discussion of the Roundtable’s recommendations for FAA consideration in the OAPM process be placed on the next Roundtable meeting agenda.

David Chan asked FAA representative Rolan Morel to look into the possibility of having controllers not reference the LAX VOR when issuing turning instruction as it most likely causes aircraft to turn early and fly over the community. David suggested that controllers should reference the shoreline or the SMO VOR. Rolan said he will look into that possibility.

16. Adjournment

Chairman Schneider noted that the next LAX Roundtable meeting is scheduled for Wednesday, September 12, 2012 and adjourned the meeting at 9:05 pm.